



VISITATION REPORT

To École Nationale Vétérinaire de Toulouse (ENVT), France

On 09 – 13 March 2020

By the Visitation Team:

Thomas Göbel, Munich, Germany: Visitor in Basic Sciences

Juan Alberto Corbera, Las Palmas de Gran Canaria, Spain: Visitor in Clinical Sciences in
Companion Animals

Daniele De Meneghi, Turin, Italy: Visitor in Clinical Sciences in Food-Producing Animals

Yngvild Wasteson (Chairperson): Oslo, Norway: Visitor in Food Safety and Quality

Eva Orban, Eötvös Loránd University, Budapest, Hungary: Visitor in Quality Assurance

David Wadsworth, Thornton-Cleveleys, United Kingdom: Practitioner

Silja Väyrynen, Estonian University of Life Sciences, Tartu, Estonia: Student

Marina Spinu, Cluj-Napoca, Romania: ESEVT Coordinator

Contents of the Visitation Report

Introduction

1. Objectives, Organisation and QA Policy
 2. Finances
 3. Curriculum
 4. Facilities and equipment
 5. Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin
 6. Learning resources
 7. Student admission, progression and welfare
 8. Student assessment
 9. Academic and support staff
 10. Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education
 11. ESEVT Indicators
 12. ESEVT Rubrics
- Executive Summary
- Glossary

Introduction

The École Nationale Vétérinaire de Toulouse (ENVT), one of the four French veterinary establishments, was founded in 1828, being relocated in 1960 to a large rural campus site in the Midi-Pyrénées Region (now Occitanie Region) and it opened for students in 1964. All French veterinary establishments are under the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Agriculture and share a common curriculum, but organise the development of the training in their own ways. Teaching, research and management at ENVT were evaluated in 2015 by the High Council for the Evaluation of Research and Higher Education and the Establishment will undergo a similar evaluation in 2020. The ENVT was visited initially by EAEVE in 1997 and subsequently in 2010, when the EAEVE team highlighted a single category 1 deficiency, “Lack of appropriate equine surgery facilities and equipment”. The ENVT was revisited in 2014 and granted full approval, after building a new equine clinic, which became operational in 2013.

Not only the ENVT is located in a prosperous agricultural and industrial area with a well-developed culture of cattle and sheep farming, but the proximity of the city provides an abundance of companion animals to enhance the veterinary education of the students. Since 2018, the national reference framework for the veterinary diploma, significantly reorganised, integrates the most recent international standards.

The average figures of the last three years indicated that the Establishment had a total of 700 recorded students, 19 interns, 15 residents and 28 PhD students. At present, these figures changed to: 745 students, 17 interns, 15 residents and 28 PhD students. In the last years, the Establishment admitted 137 (2016-2017, 2017-2018) and 160 (2018-2019) students in the first year, with an average of 130 students graduating in last three academic years (2016-2018).

The 2019 SOP is valid for the Visitation to ENVT, France.

Standard 1: Objectives, Organisation and QA Policy

1.1 The Establishment must have as its main objective the provision, in agreement with the EU Directives and ESG recommendations, of adequate, ethical, research-based, evidence-based veterinary training that enables the new graduate to perform as a veterinarian capable of entering all commonly recognised branches of the veterinary profession and to be aware of the importance of lifelong learning.

The Establishment must develop and follow its mission statement which must embrace all the ESEVT standards.

1.1.1. Findings

The Establishment is one of the four veterinary schools of France which all belong under the supervision of the Ministry of Agriculture and Food (MAA), and as institutions of higher education they are also supervised by the Ministry of Higher Education and Research. It is the extensive *Code rural et de la pêche maritime* that formulates the mission of public agricultural education and veterinary training in general.

These regulations, and consequently the Establishment, are harmonised with the respective EU and national directives. They comply with the ESEVT Standards, OIE recommendations and EU directives, and fit into the professional and diploma reference system of France.

Veterinary training and curriculum is based on a framework for professional activities and competences, which embraces all branches of the profession, and is detailed and converted to curricular decisions in the competence matrix. A new framework will be introduced from 2021 in the 1st and 2nd years.

1.1.2. Comments

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.1 because it offers to the students a broad training, preparing them for any prospective professional career in harmony with EU and national recommendations and legislation.

The joint efforts of the four veterinary schools in France for the improvement of veterinary training represent a good opportunity to pool expertise for the benefit of all participants.

1.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

1.1.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.1.

1.2 The Establishment must be part of a university or a higher education institution providing training recognised as being of an equivalent level and formally recognised as such in the respective country.

The person responsible for the veterinary curriculum and the person(s) responsible for the professional, ethical, and academic affairs of the Veterinary Teaching Hospital (VTH) must hold a veterinary degree.

The decision-making process of the Establishment must allow implementation of its strategic plan and of a cohesive study programme, in compliance with the ESEVT standards.

1.2.1. Findings

The Establishment is an independent higher education institution issuing Diplôme d'Etudes Fondamentales Vétérinaires (DEFV) after 8 semesters of study. The last, 5th year is devoted to pre-specialisation (clinical, research, industry or veterinary public health). Postgraduate studies cover internship, residency, PhD programmes, so-called school clinical diplomas (Diplôme d'école) and

specialization courses (cf. 10.3). The Establishment offers veterinary continuing education courses upon the renewed accreditation of the French Veterinary Continuing Education council in 2018.

The Establishment is supervised by the department of MAA responsible for education and research. The Deans of the four veterinary schools form an advisory body of this department. Though independent, the Establishment is also a founding member of the federative University of Toulouse. DVM and PhD titles are issued through the University for Sciences, Life Sciences and Human Health (UT3), which is a member of the Federal University of Toulouse.

The head of the Establishment, the Dean is appointed for five years by MAA after formal consultation with the Board of Directors of the Establishment. The Board of Directors directs the Establishment. It has members elected from the academic and support staff and students, and MAA-appointed external members representing stakeholders. Its president and vice-president must be professionals.

The Scientific Council consists of research staff and students involved in research, and external people nominated by the Board of Directors.

The Academic Council has 40 elected representatives of the academic staff. It is responsible for the curriculum and the validation of examination results. It also gives advice on the diplomas, organisation, positions, etc.

The Education and Student Life Council (CEVE) consists of elected academic, support staff, and student members, and external members representing the veterinary profession. It makes propositions related to student life, including programmes and student evaluation.

Besides these regulatory councils, there are committees participating in the governance of the institution: the Executive Committee (BURDIR, top managers enhancing strategic decision making and managing day-to-day affairs), the Steering Committee (CODIR, assisting BURDIR, execution, post openings, and budget preparation), Scientific facilitation group, Training committee (COFOR, CEVE head and department heads dealing with initial training and educational programmes), Technical committee, Hygiene and Safety committee (safety of staff) and Ethics committee.

The management of some strategic missions is entrusted by a mission letter to academics such as simulation for education and self-learning, continuing education, ethics committee, digital education and cultural heritage. They join the management committees. New commissions to be set up in this academic year are Biosafety/biosecurity commission and Communication commission.

Curriculum related bodies, and organisational units as well as teaching hospitals are headed by veterinarians.

1.2.2. Comments

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.2 because it is a higher education institution issuing the DVM and PhD titles via the University of Toulouse by University for Sciences, Life Sciences and Human Health; its management, including the head of the VTH, consists mostly of veterinarians; and it has a committee structure ensuring the achievement of the ESEVT Standards.

1.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

1.2.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.2.

1.3 The Establishment must have a strategic plan, which includes a SWOT analysis of its current activities, a list of objectives, and an operating plan with a timeframe and indicators for its implementation.

1.3.1. Findings

The Establishment has a strategic plan for the period 2017–2021 based on an in-depth SWOT analysis, which was revised in 2019. There are 3+1 goals identified, with some more specific objectives under each, which address issues, and actions are defined to tackle these. There are one or more indicators for the performance of each objective in their detailed description. There is also a timeframe with responsible persons for the fulfilment of the strategic plan.

1.3.2. Comments

The revision of the SWOT analysis is also a projection of trends during the strategic period indicating enhancements, stagnation and deterioration.

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.3, having a strategic plan with SWOT-analysis in place which is updated.

1.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

1.3.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.3.

1.4 The Establishment must have a policy and associated written procedures for the assurance of the quality and standards of its programmes and awards. It must also commit itself explicitly to the development of a culture which recognises the importance of quality, and quality assurance, within their Establishment. To achieve this, the Establishment must develop and implement a strategy for the continuous enhancement of quality. The development and implementation of the Establishment's strategy must include a role for students and other stakeholders, both internal and external, and the strategy must have a formal status and be publicly available.

1.4.1. Findings

The Dean of the Establishment issued a written statement of quality policy expressing the commitment of the management to quality assurance. Since the strategy of the Establishment raised quality management to the status of an integrating element of the development of the Establishment, there is no doubt about the intention of creating and enhancing quality culture at the Establishment. The first steps have already been taken in this direction before 2017 when the quality policy was issued.

After this, the quality department was strengthened, and quality seminars/workshops were organised both for the management and for the staff in 2017 and 2019 respectively. In 2018 a collective (TEPAQUAP) was set up of staff and students to implement actions decided upon in 2017. This group collects needs and proposals from the community, evaluates certain practices, and submits proposals to CODIR. Managerial techniques, enhancing quality culture, such as facilitating collective intelligence are employed, and members of the quality department go out to organisational units for checks and consultations, which they document.

Many procedures have been formalized for the quality management system, and process pilots have been trained. Processes and procedures have recently been implemented, and a network of quality contact persons is being set up.

There are several quality management systems which are used in the laboratory and research activities of the Establishment (GLP, ISO 9000, ISO 9001, quality systems of different organisations, etc.) The Establishment is a member of several quality associations (Research Quality Association, Société Française d'Assurance Qualité, QEES club, Qualitevet).

1.4.2. Comments

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.4, the management being committed to quality assurance and making efforts for strengthening the quality culture in the Establishment, which should be continued and broadened.

1.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

1.4.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.4.

1.5 The Establishment must provide evidence that it interacts with its stakeholders and the wider society. Such public information must be clear, objective and readily accessible; the information must include up-to-date information about the study programme, views and employment destinations of past students as well as the profile of the current student population.

The Establishment's website must mention the ESEVT Establishment's status and its last Self Evaluation Report and Visitation Report must be easily available for the public.

1.5.1. Findings

The Establishment's main communication channel is its website, which includes all relevant information with regard to training programmes, continuous education, alumni, quality work, etc. The information is timely, valid and objective. The Establishment is also present on social media, and has a formal plan for communication. However, there is only a link to the EAEVE homepage in relation to its ESEVT status.

Applicants for admission to the Establishment get ample information regarding the veterinary profession, and this is reinforced by the 1.5-day annual meetings, organised by alumni, where 1st year students get an overview of the diverse career opportunities open to veterinarians. A detailed "demographic atlas" offers a great deal of information regarding the profession.

Students and stakeholders are members of the relevant councils and committees of the Establishment, thus they have the chance to formally convey their needs and suggestions to the management. There is also a lively relationship between the local vets of the region and the clinical teaching staff and the students going for EMTs and EPTs.

1.5.2. Comments

The demographic atlas of the veterinary profession offers very detailed and extensive information about all possible career options for veterinarians.

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.5, with reliable, timely and broad information about the training programme as well as career perspectives. Participation in relevant committees of the representatives of the profession as well as the intense relations with practicing professionals provide opportunities for gaining information about and incorporating the needs of stakeholders to training.

1.5.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

1.5.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.5.

1.6 The Establishment must monitor and periodically review its activities, both quantitative and qualitative, to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the

needs of students and society. The Establishment must make public how this analysis of information has been utilised in the further development of its activities and provide evidence as to the involvement of both students and staff in the provision, analysis and implementation of such data.

Any action planned or taken as a result of this data analysis must be communicated to all those concerned.

1.6.1. Findings

Indicators and actions of the contract of objectives and performance are reviewed annually during the strategic interview between MAA and the Establishment. There will be an assessment at the end of the strategic period when objectives will be monitored (through deadlines and indicators for actions). For the assessment of research and international policy, MAA established specific indicators to be measured annually.

From the point of view of the continuous development of veterinary training, the evaluation of teaching by students (cf. 5.1.4) is of primary importance. The statistical results of this survey are made available to students, and results are analysed and used for improvement by coordinators, academic staff, and the management of the Establishment.

The implementation of key practical and clinical activities during practical and clinical rotations is assessed by the teacher in charge of the rotations. So far as extramural practical training is concerned: the lecturer checks that EPT conditions are met, and students fill an assessment form of their EPT. The results of this assessment are available for the students looking for an EPT. Based on the assessment the EPT commission may cut practices at EPT places that do not live up to the requirements.

There is a set of indicators which the Establishment uses for the assessment of its development in different fields.

1.6.2. Comments

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.6 because several indicators and measurements are utilised for the monitoring and improvement of training and research processes, and it is sharing the results with relevant groups of stakeholders.

1.6.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

1.6.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.6.

1.7 The Establishment must undergo external review through the ESEVT on a cyclical basis. Evidence must be provided of such external evaluation with the assurance that the progress made since the last ESEVT evaluation was linked to a continuous quality assurance process.

1.7.1. Findings

The Establishment was evaluated by EAEVE in 2010, and a revisit was made in 2014 in which it was proved that the category 1 deficiency that had been found in 2010 was made up for. Besides, the Establishment is also accredited by the High Council for Evaluation of Research and Higher Education (HCERES) every 5 years.

1.7.2. Comments

Elements of quality management system were already found at the time of the previous Visitation. Since then, the quality approach has become a major element of the management policy of the Establishment, and a guiding principle in its strategic plan.

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.7 because it regularly undergoes external evaluations covering its activity comprehensively or partially; it is clearly committed to continuous improvement, and there are indicators in place that can be used for monitoring this development.

1.7.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

1.7.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 1.7.

Standard 2: Finances

2.1 Finances must be demonstrably adequate to sustain the requirements for the Establishment to meet its mission and to achieve its objectives for education, research and services. The description must include both expenditures (separated into personnel costs, operating costs, maintenance costs and equipment) and revenues (separated into public funding, tuition fees, services, research grants and other sources).

2.1.1. Findings

The ENV'T's revenues and expenditures are presented in Tables 2.1.1, 2.1.2 and 2.1.3 of the SER. The majority of ENV'T's revenue comes from the Ministry of Agriculture and Food (in 2018-2019 this constituted 70% of the total). All salaries of civil servants are directly covered by the Ministry, while the salaries for the school's publicly funded contractual staffs is included in the school's budget.

The Ministry of Agriculture and Food also allocates an operational fund annually, supports research activities and participates in infrastructure investments. Other important revenue sources for ENV'T are student tuition fee, clinical services and continuing education activities. In table 2.1.2, research grants only constitute a minor part of the revenues (2% of the total). Research activities are, however, carried out in joint units mainly with INRA and INSERM. Grants can pass through either the ENV'T budget or the INRA/INSERM budgets, and table 2.1.2 only shows the resources (i.e. mostly operational costs and not salaries for the civil servants) going through the ENV'T budget.

The final budget is approved by the Board of Directors at ENV'T, after a long process involving several actors at ENV'T, and validation by the Ministry of Agriculture and Food. ENV'T states that they have enough self-financing capacity to ensure its main missions (teaching and research).

2.1.2. Comments

The fact that the Ministry of Agriculture and Food has already announced that ENV'T is a priority for real estate investment under the State-Region Program 2021-2026 is a great opportunity for ENV'T for renovating and restructuring the campus facilities.

2.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

2.1.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 2.1.

2.2 Clinical and field services must function as instructional resources. Instructional integrity of these resources must take priority over financial self-sufficiency of clinical services operations.

The Establishment must have sufficient autonomy in order to use the resources to implement its strategic plan and to meet the ESEVT Standards.

2.2.1. Findings

The Veterinary Teaching Hospital consists of two units; the companion animal VTH (i.e. small animals and equine) and the ruminant VTH. These two units have their respective leader and budget. The revenues generated by the clinical activities are entirely and exclusively allocated to their operation. Each year, the hospital leaders propose a provisional budget to the management in the context of the management consultation.

The total budgets for ENVV are discussed with the Ministry of Agriculture and Food based on annual strategic interviews. The detailed budget proposal made by ENVV must be validated by the Ministry before it is finally approved by the Board of Directors. With this mandatory process in mind, the Establishment has sufficient autonomy in order to use the resources to implement its strategic plan and to meet the ESEVT Standards.

2.2.2. Comments

None.

2.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

2.2.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 2.2.

2.3 Resources allocation must be regularly reviewed to ensure that available resources meet the requirements.

2.3.1. Findings

The budget process is in short described as follows: the different managers report their needs, and all proposed budgets are then processed by the Department of Financial Affairs. The Executive Committee does the necessary trade-offs for the budget balance, and a proposal is presented for approval by the Steering committee. This approved proposal is sent for validation by the Ministry of Agriculture and Food and the regional budget assessor. Finally, the Board of Directors votes over the budget. Each manager gets a notification about their respective budgets for the coming year following the decision in the Board of Directors.

The basis for the reports from the managers is communication between the Department of Financial Affairs and the managers, including administrative orientations and discussion about strategic choices.

2.3.2. Comments

The budget process is a comprehensive process repeated in annual cycles, building on experience gathered through the previous years and depending on strategic choices.

2.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

2.3.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 2.3.

Standard 3: Curriculum

3.1 The curriculum must be designed, resourced and managed to ensure all graduates have achieved the graduate attributes expected to be fully compliant with the EU Directive 2005/36/EC (as amended by directive 2013/55/EU) and its Annex V.4.1. The curriculum must include the subjects (input) and must allow the acquisition of the Day One Competences (output) listed in Annex 2. This concerns Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets), Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management), Food Safety and Quality, and Professional Knowledge.

3.1.1. General findings

3.1.1.1. Findings

The curriculum with a new framework based on eight macro skills (four specific skills: advise and prevent; establish individual or collective diagnoses; care for and treat; act for public health; four cross disciplinary skills: work in a business; communicate; act scientifically; act responsibly) started in September 2019 for years 1 and 2 (S5 to S8) and will be extended to the successive years. Four French veterinary schools in association with students and various stakeholders prepared the framework. A competency matrix was prepared. It maps in detail the competences to the syllabus. Each module has its own description as syllabus.

Semesters S1 to S4 resemble two years of study after Baccalaureat, mostly as Scientific Baccalaureat. The specific curriculum runs from S5 to S12 (e.g. four years) and lists 30 ECTS credits per semester, e.g. 60 ECTS per year leading to the Diplôme d'études Fondamentales Veterinaires (DEFV). The last year (S13, S14) is dedicated to pre-specialization in diverse areas. In summary, 300 ECTS credits are accomplished after five years and 420 ECTS credits in total.

The percentage of lectures and seminars ranges from 21% to 67% in years 1 to 4 and decreases thereafter depending on the major (range between 4% and 34%). Lab work ranges from 4% to 23%. Animal work (non-clinical and clinical) is low in years 1 and 2 (5% and 4%, respectively) and increases thereafter (28% in year 3 and 72% in year 4). In the year 5 it ranges between 66% and 93%.

3.1.1.2. Comments

The curriculum is comprehensive and well-structured and thus is designed to ensure full compliance with EU Directive 2005/36/EC. The mentoring of younger students by more advanced students is a teaching method that engages and motivates the students and has a pronounced learning effect for the older students. Teachers and students are very enthusiastic and interact intensively. Self-directed learning is integrated in the curriculum and students take responsibility to achieve learning outcomes. The matrix-based system of curriculum mapping to the defined competences allows a quick and substantial monitoring of student progression.

3.1.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.1.1.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.1.1

3.1.2. Basic Sciences

3.1.2.1. Findings

The basic subjects as listed in Annex V.4.1 of the EU Directive 2005/36/EC (physics, chemistry,

zoology, plant biology and mathematics) are mainly covered by the preparatory courses. Botany, biostatistics and part of zoology are taught during the 1st year. The basic sciences are all covered extensively with a total amount of 1187.70 hours making up a third of the total hours in years 1 to 4.

3.1.2.2. Comments

The first year students get concise training in basic sciences. The inclusion of live animals in subjects like physiology is excellent to get students involved and interested in basic sciences. Teaching in small groups enhances the learning experience. Anatomy is mainly restricted to systematic teaching and practical dissections are performed on canine and sheep (also see Substandard 5.1). Topographic anatomy is demonstrated during necropsy. There is a good balance between different subjects with an emphasis on parasitology. Professional ethics and communication are also included in the basic sciences.

3.1.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.1.2.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.1.2.

3.1.3. Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets)

3.1.3.1. Findings

The French professional and diploma reference framework imposes that the fourth year must be predominantly clinical and practical, one semester being devoted to medicine of small animals, sports and leisure animals, and the other semester to large animal medicine and veterinary public health. In the fifth and final year, students can choose one of the 6 possible majors (small animals, large animals, equines, veterinary public health, research or industry).

Related to the subjects and hours leading to the evidence of formal qualifications in veterinary medicine included in the study programme of the ENV-Toulouse as defined in the EU Directive 2005/36/EC (as amended by directive 2013/55/EU) and its Annex V.4.1 and in the ESEVT SOP 2019, it is highlighted in table 3.1.2. (SER page 28 and 29) that all the subjects are included and the hours for theoretical and practical training are appropriately for the acquisition of Day One Competences (D1C).

4th year students complete the clinical training divided in rotation in the different clinics, particularly 18 weeks at the small animal hospital and 2 weeks at the equine clinic. Students are divided in groups of 5-10, in collaboration with 5th year students. The programmed student group is split in different services; therefore, no more than 3-4 students complete the clinical work in one patient.

5th year students spend 22 weeks at the small animal's hospital or 10 weeks at the equine hospital.

The 3rd, 4th and 5th year students participate actively in the clinical activity in small animals, while only 4th and 5th year students complete their equine clinical training in the equine clinic.

3.1.3.2. Comments

Because the fifth year of the curriculum (semesters S13 and S14) is a pre-specialisation year, the clinical training provided is considered elective. Therefore, at the end of semester S12, the ENV-Toulouse offers the same opportunities to all students for the acquisition of D1C as defined in the Annex 2 (SOP of ESEVT). So, D1C are completely trained at the end of the fourth year (*Diplôme d'Études Fondamentales Vétérinaires*). The clinical training in the fifth year is reserved to strengthen the clinical skills previously learned or expand specialty knowledge. The curriculum allows the acquisition of the Day One Competences, particularly in the clinical sciences in companion animal.

Although the curriculum allows the acquisition of Day One Competences, particularly in the clinical sciences in companion animals, a suboptimal use of a logbook system for recording clinical skills for every student has been found (see Substandard 8.5, partial compliance).

The software Compet Vet Suivi (monitoring the acquisition of skills), Compet Vet Eval (assessing skills) and Compet Vet Valid (validation), which is under construction and scheduled release in 2020, is a good opportunity to revise the curriculum after a good and deep analysis of the results in the next future for the ENVs. This is a project worthy of praise.

3.1.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.1.3.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.1.3.

3.1.4. Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management)

3.1.4.1. Findings

The “Specific veterinary subjects”, “Clinical Sciences” and “Animal Production” subjects related to Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management) are well allocated and balanced within the Curriculum hours. Overall, there is an adequate balance between theoretical and practical training. The practical rotations related to Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals, performed at the VTH (intra-mural clinics) under academic staff supervision start in year 3: for ruminants, there are 4 week rotations in Medicine in year 3, and 2 weeks in year 4; 1 week in Diagnostic pathology in year 3, and 0.5 week in year 4; 1 week in Obstetrics, reproduction and reproductive disorders in year 4. Besides, there are 2 weeks rotations in Herd health management (ruminants) and 2 weeks in Obstetrics, reproduction and reproductive disorders (ruminants) in year 3 and year 4; for pigs and poultry there are 3 weeks in Herd health management in year 4. In all practical rotations, students have to prepare a report where they present their conclusions during a final session with the lecturers and other students. Emphasis is placed on evidence-based medicine, communication, biosecurity and ethics. To support clinical training, in 2018-2019, hands-on training using mannequins and simulators has been introduced, and made available to students to learn technical gestures. As regards the majors/tracks (in year 5) related to Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals, there are 19 weeks of practical rotations offered in Medicine for ruminants and 3 weeks in Poultry farming and diseases, and 1 week in Pig farming and medicine on site (Table 3.1.3 of the SER, Practical rotations under academic staff supervision, excluding EPT). During EPT strong relationships between the student, the mentor/tutor and ENVT lecturer are built.

3.1.4.2. Comments

During 3rd and 4th years, the training approach is mainly based on clinical examination and relies on companionship by students from subsequent years under the supervision of a lecturer. During the 5th year the pedagogical approach involves more actively the students to study clinical cases in depth, thus enabling the promotion of evidence-based medicine. The subjects/disciplines related to Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management) are adequately distributed throughout the last years. The subjects/disciplines related to Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals have a sufficient number of hours and there is an adequate balance between theoretical and practical training. As regards the new skill framework issued in 2017 (yet applied to 1st and 2nd years only), the subjects and learning objectives, the steps/phases of theoretical, practical and clinical training -as described in the curriculum- can guarantee that

graduates achieve the macro-skills and abilities listed for Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals.

3.1.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.1.4.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.1.4.

3.1.5. Food Safety and Quality

3.1.5.1. Findings

Food safety and quality (FSQ), Veterinary Public Health (VPH) and One Health concept (OH) are in total taught for 330.75 hours, giving 15 ECTS. More than half of the teaching is lectures and seminars. The number of hours (indicator no. 16) is above the mean value given in the List of ESEVT Indicators. The number of hours of extra-mural practical training in FSQ and VPH (indicator no. 17) is in the range between the median and minimal values given in the List of ESEVT Indicators. All elements described in the list of subjects (SOP Annex 2) are included.

Rotations under academic staff supervision are organized in year 3 and year 4. In year 3, groups of about 10 students per group have three weeks of rotations in hygiene and food industry. In year 4, groups of about 13-14 students per group have three weeks of rotations in hygiene and food industry. These rotations include basic compulsory training in three multi-species slaughterhouses and five premises for production of animal-based foods. A multi-species slaughterhouse means that the students are exposed to slaughtering of cattle, small ruminants and pigs, while the Establishments reports that now it has been very difficult to get access to poultry slaughterhouses. The students do, however, visit a poultry farm and do post-mortem examinations there. The teaching in the slaughterhouse, which is focused on organ and carcass inspections, is done by the teachers from ENVV, and they have a good collaboration with the official control service on site.

In the 12th semester (2nd semester of year 4), all students do an EPT which is a 4-week clinical training course for food animals and slaughterhouse inspection. During this period, each student spends four half-days in a slaughterhouse following the veterinary inspector. This is where they learn ante-mortem control and training in inspection on the slaughter line.

3.1.5.2. Comments

Following visits to the food-producing facilities, the student groups must summarize and present their findings to the other groups, focusing on HACCP and relevant food safety aspects. One of the facilities visited by the students is the central kitchen of the AIRBUS premises in Toulouse, where AIRBUS has its headquarters.

There is no specific laboratory course in food safety in the curriculum. Most of the training in the FSQ is given as theoretical teaching, including seminars, discussions etc., in addition to several visits to the slaughterhouses. The teaching has a clear focus on animal-derived food, and less on other food items, drinking water and more environmentally related subjects.

3.1.5.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.1.5.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.1.5.

3.1.6. Professional Knowledge

3.1.6.1. Findings

Professional Knowledge is taught throughout the course from year 1-4: Ethics and communication (115 hrs), Legislation, regulation, forensic controls and certification economics and practice management (131.75 hrs) and in year 5, Economics and Practice Management of Poultry farms (Poultry clinics 28 hrs), Equine clinics, ethics and communication (7.5hrs) and Legislation etc. (8.5 hrs), as part of the IMR small animal rotation year 3 - 1 week and as a component (6 hrs) of the optional laboratory animal course.

3.1.6.2. Comments

Students were aware of and appreciated the Professional Knowledge components of the curriculum.

3.1.6.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.1.6.4 Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.1.6.

3.2 Each study programme provided by the Establishment must be competency-based and designed so that it meets the objectives set for it, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme must be clearly specified and communicated and must refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

The Establishment must provide proof of a QA system that promotes and monitors the presence of an academic environment highly conducive to learning including self-learning. Details of the type, provision and updating of appropriate learning opportunities for the students must be clearly described, as well as the involvement of students.

The Establishment must also describe how it encourages and prepares students for self-learning and lifelong learning.

3.2.1. Findings

The qualification at the end of the programme fits in the national and European qualifications framework and is clearly communicated on the homepage together with the career options for graduating students in the demographic atlas of the veterinary profession (<http://www.envt.fr/menu-og-31/atlas-de-la-profession-v%C3%A9t%C3%A9rinaire>).

The new competency framework (cf. ENVT Matrix and CompetVet documentation) elaborates in great detail on the competences which serve as a lighthouse for the whole of the training. Competences are broken down into sub-competences, and the underlying knowledge, the veterinary procedures related, and the means by which the acquisition of the given competence is assessed are enumerated. The required level of proficiency is also set (seen/done under supervision/performed independently). All this will be monitored through an e-portfolio.

In order to provide for competency training, the Establishment offers a great choice and proportion of practical training (clinical rotations). It is possible to gain experience with horses, and performing examinations and minor interventions at the riding centre.

Innovative training methods are introduced and reviewed each year such as group work, inverted classes, simulation, etc. and presented to teaching staff. Time is allocated to group work, and self-learning. There are some rooms available for self-learning. The library is involved in the teaching/learning process to make students capable of the use of the databases and resources also remotely accessible. On-demand courses and tutorials are also available enhancing the searching

and use of literature.

Feedback on teaching (content, method and assessment) is provided by students through several channels. First, there is an annual assessment of teaching via the Sphinx system, which covers many aspects of the training. Besides there is a representative for each subject who liaises with the lecturers, and there is direct contact with lecturers and mentors at EPTs.

The veterinary thesis offers an introduction to scientific approach and a possibility for individual work. The library, the digital environment, and the simulation room is facilitating individual learning.

The Establishment also offers continuing educational courses.

3.2.2. Comments

It is positive that the MAA supports the competency training of veterinarians by issuing “Annex to the ministerial decree of 20 April 2007 relating to veterinary studies”. This provides all the French veterinary schools with a solid background for curriculum planning.

There is estimated time allocated for individual work for each subject in the syllabus.

The riding centre offers a possibility to gain practice in every-day, routine tasks with horses.

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.2 because it is competency-based, fitting into the European and national framework, and has a learning environment conducive to self-learning and life-long development.

3.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.2.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.2.

3.3 Programme learning outcomes must:

- **ensure the effective alignment of all content, teaching, learning and assessment activities of the degree programme to form a cohesive framework**
- **include a description of Day One Competences**
- **form the basis for explicit statements of the objectives and learning outcomes of individual units of study**
- **be communicated to staff and students**
- **be regularly reviewed, managed and updated to ensure they remain relevant, adequate and are effectively achieved.**

3.3.1. Findings

The competency framework is mapped onto a matrix of competences, which translates competences into modules/subjects and offers a complete framework of the degree programme. The matrix's elements in terms of content, method of teaching, self-learning time required, assessment methods, etc. are all included in the module descriptions available on the internet, and updated annually by the responsible lecturer taking into account the results of students' assessment of teaching.

3.3.2. Comments

A very thorough analysis and as a result a curriculum deduced from the output is demonstrated in the system represented by the competency framework, matrix and the syllabus. Careful development of the curriculum is made possible by the available mechanisms. However, there are some elements of the system still under construction.

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.3 because learning outcomes are coherent, explicitly stated, and regularly reviewed.

3.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.3.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.3.

3.4 The Establishment must have a formally constituted committee structure (which includes effective student representation), with clear and empowered reporting lines, to oversee and manage the curriculum and its delivery. The committee(s) must:

- **determine the pedagogical basis, design, delivery methods and assessment methods of the curriculum**
- **oversee QA of the curriculum, particularly gathering, evaluating, making change and responding to feedback from stakeholders, peer reviewers and external assessors, and data from examination/assessment outcomes**
- **perform on going and periodic review of the curriculum at least every seven years by involving staff, students and stakeholders; these reviews must lead to continuous improvement. Any action taken or planned as a result of such a review must be communicated to all those concerned**
- **identify and meet training needs for all types of staff, maintaining and enhancing their competence for the ongoing curriculum development.**

3.4.1. Findings

The course descriptions include all relevant information and are available on the website, and updated annually (follow-up can be seen at the end of the Fiches pédagogiques).

The cycle of regular curricular development and its organisational background is illustrated by appendix Stand_3.3_App004. The syllabus is discussed at several levels: COFOR meetings, CEVE, and DEVE. The final decision regarding the approval of the syllabus stays with the Board of Directors (CA) (cf. appendix Stand_3.3_App004). If necessary they initiate a change in the academic regulations as well.

The annual assessment of teaching by students takes place via the Sphinx platform. The results are shared with module, department, DEVE heads and the Dean. Suggestions for improvement are initiated by module heads, and are approved in the above committees.

A so-called Tapaquap working group, consisting of teachers and students, works on the methodology for assessing teaching, enhancing the regular improvement of teaching (see also 9.5).

Associate professors, who are recruited through a careful selection process, have the opportunity (and are strongly encouraged) to attend a 4-week intensive national pedagogical training programme which covers learning objectives, teaching methods, assessment, learning methods, and personal projects. The University of Toulouse also organises short training programmes. Lecturers' activity reports, to be prepared every four years, also include a part on their teaching activities, and are peer reviewed by the lecturers' evaluation committee. Their first year is a trial period during which tutor lecturers accompany them, at the end of which they write an activity report.

See also: 9.2–9.4

3.4.2. Comments

There is due emphasis on the pedagogical qualities of lecturers, which is enhanced in several ways and ample feedback is provided for those at the beginning of their teaching career.

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.4 because the committee background of curriculum development and the pedagogical background of the teaching staff are provided for.

3.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.4.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.4.

3.5 External Practical Training (EPT) is compulsory training activities organised outside the Establishment, the student being under the direct supervision of a non-academic person (e.g. a practitioner). EPT cannot replace the core intramural training nor the extramural training under the close supervision of academic staff (e.g. ambulatory clinics, herd health management, practical training in FSQ and VPH).

Since the veterinary degree is a professional qualification with Day One Competences, EPT must complement and strengthen the academic education inter alia by enhancing student's professional knowledge.

3.5.1. Findings

Students have to complete 4 weeks of compulsory EPT outside France at the end of the second year. Students have to complete 14 weeks Compulsory EPT in France by the end of year 4. This EPT (location and subject) is supervised by academic staff and assessed by written and oral examinations and is considered fully fledged teaching modules. Optional EPT for periods of more than one week is accepted. This CPT must include 4 weeks large animal (preclinical), 4 weeks large animal (clinical), half a week FSQ and VPH, 6 weeks on a research and development project but does not involve any small animal pre-clinical work.

In year 5, mandatory EPT varies in duration and topic within the chosen major.

3.5.2. Comments

Students generally valued the period of study abroad at the end of the second year. The Establishment is to be commended on this feature which broadens the life experience for the students as well as forms an important backdrop to their clinical studies in France. The clinical skills acquired by students during their EPT placements complement the intramural teaching and are a valuable part of the learning process.

3.5.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.5.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.5.

3.6 The EPT providers must have an agreement with the Establishment and the student (in order to state their respective rights and duties, including insurance matters), provide a standardised evaluation of the performance of the student during their EPT and be allowed to provide feedback to the Establishment on the EPT programme.

There must be a member of the academic staff responsible for the overall supervision of the EPT, including liaison with EPT providers.

3.6.1. Findings

EPT is controlled by the EPT commission and the Head of Education and Student life who oversees applications. A teacher is assigned to the student and is responsible for the overall supervision of the EPT. In general practice, a SNVEL (Syndicat National des Vétérinaires d'Exercice Libéral – National Union of Veterinary Practitioners) charter is signed by the practice mentor and the student to specify their commitments. Once the EPT is accepted, the students are covered by ENVV insurance.

3.6.2. Comments

Procedures and evidence of evaluation of the performance of the student and feedback from the practice was observed. The students were responsible, with guidance, for organising their own placements, which may be in France or abroad and their report on the placement was seen. A veterinary association, National Union of Liberal Veterinarians, is actively involved when a clinical practice is chosen with a charter being read and signed by both student and practice before the placement occurs.

3.6.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.6.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.6.

3.7 Students must take responsibility for their own learning during EPT. This includes preparing properly before each placement, keeping a proper record of their experience during EPT by using a logbook provided by the Establishment and evaluating the EPT. Students must be allowed to complain officially and/or anonymously about issues occurring during EPT. The Establishment must have a system of QA to monitor the implementation, progress and then feedback within the EPT activities.

3.7.1. Findings

ENVT maintains a database of EPT providers and tutors. Students research a suitable provider, depending on the EPT topic. The referring teacher assesses and assists the student with the placement, its objectives, methodology and requires a report during the EPT period. The student has to report on the assignment on the database available to all students. The student fills in an assessment form (log) of their EPT. The referring teacher is available to solve any problems occurring during EPT and providers failing to meet the requirements of the EPT can be excluded from future involvement by the commission.

3.7.2. Comments

Copies of student EPT logbooks were seen. A system is in place to allow student feedback which may be beneficial to future students. This feedback provides a quality assurance mechanism with practices receiving a poor report being excluded from the programme in the future.

3.7.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

3.7.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 3.7.

Standard 4: Facilities and equipment

4.1 All aspects of the physical facilities must provide an environment conducive to learning, including internet access. The veterinary Establishment must have a clear strategy and programme for maintaining and upgrading its buildings and equipment. Facilities must comply with all relevant legislation including health, safety, biosecurity, accessibility to people with reduced mobility, and EU animal welfare and care standards.

4.1.1. Findings

The school occupies a site of 54 hectares divided into three areas: 1. Principally, administration, clinics and educational space. 2. Mainly for student accommodation, catering and sports including the equine centre 3. Mainly land reserve used by the equestrian centre. 60% of the school buildings are related to teaching, clinical and research activities.

The main campus is supported by an IT network infrastructure which covers the needs for teaching and research purposes. It is connected to the RENATR national academic network via the regional Federation of Universities and “grandes écoles”. Infrastructures and network equipment are regularly renewed every 6-8 years or earlier if capacity building is required.

The Health, Safety and Biosecurity Department is included in the organisation of the Establishment. Therefore, there is a proper management of these topics, such as maintenance of chemical fume hoods, anaesthesia equipment, etc.

Since the last inspection there has been construction of an Emergency and Intensive care unit, and currently the building of a Ruminant Hospital and Small animals operating theatres is being undertaken. Other buildings have been refurbished.

4.1.2. Comments

The campus is large, well maintained and well connected to the city and the nearby airport. The ENVT facilities are contained in many buildings, some being built fifty years ago. This creates problems in the bovine and equine clinics which do not meet modern standards or easily allow the application of the current legislation concerning biosecurity and animal welfare and care. There were insufficient ventilation, cleaning and biosecurity procedures in place in some areas of the ruminant clinic. The ruminant clinic is separated into two areas connected by an outside concrete path which forces students and staff to wear the same professional clothes when moving between the two areas. This represents a biosecurity issue. The isolation pen is sited to this pathway and is not fit for purpose.

The pharmacy sited in the small animal clinic operates according to current legislation and all the correct checking and disposal procedures are followed. However, some partially used antibiotic etc. bottles were found to be still in use, in both the equine and ruminant clinics, after the expiry of the use by date. Some blood collection tubes were also outdated.

The Establishment has a plan and the building process of the new ruminant facility is well advanced (opening date 2020 June) and this will negate the defects observed and reduce costs. In the opinion of the Establishment, the unification of the facilities will also promote major cooperation between the different departments and units.

4.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

The new ruminant clinic which is under construction will provide the best standard for animal welfare and care, and it should meet the relevant legislation for biosecurity and biosafety.

The refurbishment of the equine facilities, particularly the “Radiologie equine” which includes part of the isolation area for equines, should be undertaken to provide the best animal care and biosecurity standards. The move of the ruminant clinic to the new building will be an opportunity to refurbish the buildings 13b and 13c in order to improve the equine clinic and promote and provide a 24/7 service.

The pharmacy protocol for drug control should be strictly applied in the equine and ruminant clinics. The management of residual drugs should be revised to promote the higher standard for the waste management of drugs.

4.1.4. Decision

The Establishment is partially compliant with Substandard 4.1 because of sub-optimal compliance of some of the physical facilities with relevant legislation concerning biosecurity and EU animal welfare and care standards.

4.2 Lecture theatres, teaching laboratories, tutorial rooms, clinical facilities and other teaching spaces must be adequate in number, size and equipped for the instructional purposes and must be well maintained. The facilities must be adapted for the number of students enrolled. Students must have ready access to adequate and sufficient study, self-learning, recreation, locker, sanitary and food service facilities.

Offices, teaching preparation and research laboratories must be sufficient for the needs of the academic and support staff.

4.2.1. Findings

There are 5 lecture theatres seating 125 students each with full Wi-Fi, projectors, boards and sound systems and 1 theatre seating 210 persons, equipped as above with a camera for recording lectures and adapted for persons with reduced mobility. There are 24 tutorial rooms (total area 1223 m²), of which 19 have projectors, boards, sound systems and Wi-Fi, 3 are located in the library, one of which has a computer and printer.

There are 17 laboratories of which 12 are used for practical work (1124 m²) and 5 preparation rooms (34 m²). There are 3 skills laboratories (50 m²) for preclinical simulation based training on models.

There are 4 rooms for study and self-directed learning (82 students), a canteen seating 460 students, 64 locker rooms with 300 places, 3 rooms for students on call (37 places), a leisure area with 29 rooms and space for 412 students and appropriate sanitary facilities (203 places).

The staff offices occupy a surface area of 3798 m² with each work station having a space of 16.16 m² and research laboratories, 3064 m² with an individual work area of 29.64 m².

4.2.2. Comments

The facilities dedicated to students' life in the Campus are worthy of commendation. The buildings for accommodation of students, the restaurant area, and particularly the "cercle des élèves" are praiseworthy. These facilities encourage the integration of students into the whole University experience. The cercle des élèves includes a cafeteria, administration, TV rooms, several students' clubs including aquatic animals and fish, terrestrial mammals and a music room, etc. It also has changing rooms for many sports, and recreation facilities. The cercle is run and managed entirely by the students. Student accommodation is appropriate as are the offices and research laboratories.

The Establishment provides a limited number of study rooms for the students in the library with two larger rooms for groups up to 10 persons. Therefore, the majority of the students study at home or in their accommodation – they do not find this onerous.

Four lecture theatres were designed for a maximum of 125 students per year. With the increase of the number of student to 160, there are insufficient places in these theatres. There is one large theatre accommodating 250 persons. The Establishment is aware of this situation and is considering the modification of the campus in the near future.

Since teaching laboratories (i.e. histology) seat 25 students, it is necessary that practical sessions are repeated by the lecturers.

4.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

4.2.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 4.2.

4.3 The livestock facilities, animal housing, core clinical teaching facilities and equipment used by the Establishment for teaching purposes must:

- **be sufficient in capacity and adapted for the number of students enrolled in order to allow safe hands-on training for all students**

- **be of a high standard, well maintained and fit for the purpose**
- **promote best husbandry, welfare and management practices**
- **ensure relevant biosecurity and bio-containment**
- **be designed to enhance learning.**

4.3.1. Findings

Separate facilities accommodate animals kept for research purposes (rooms for rodents, small ruminants and poultry and also cats, dogs and pigs) and animals used for teaching (rodents, ruminants, dogs and poultry). There are more than 75 cages available for hospitalised small animals, 22 boxes for equines, several for exotic pets and 25 stalls/boxes for ruminants.

There are 10 isolation cages available for companion animals, 3 isolation boxes for equines and 1 external pen for ruminants. Close to the ruminant pen there were three calf boxes used for isolation. The equipment used in the Ruminant clinic, includes echography, surgical and anaesthetic equipment as well as the basic requirements.

In the exotic/wildlife area (16 rooms), there are two anaesthetic machines, a doppler, pulse oximeter, oxygen generator and oxygen, a laboratory analysis area, 2 consulting rooms, an operating theatre and intensive care room with equipment.

The equine hospital (31 rooms) has anaesthetic, preparation and induction equipment, surgical equipment, echography and endoscopy equipment, 2 consulting rooms, hospitalisation boxes, a pharmacy, analysis laboratory recovery box, X-ray room and viewing room, ophthalmology equipment and lockers.

In the Companion animal hospital (24 rooms), there is the basic equipment plus anaesthetic and endoscopy equipment, 2 group work rooms, surgery and medical care rooms, locker rooms for men and women, 2 catteries – 1 for long-stay patients and one for ambulatory patients and accommodation for on call students.

The Emergency-Intensive care unit includes two consultation rooms, an intensive care room, a hospitalisation room, an analysis and microscopy laboratory, blood sampling equipment and a blood bank, recovery and monitoring equipment, echography and anaesthetic equipment, and a students' meeting room. In the same part of the building, without being part of the EIC there are the chemotherapy preparation and the treatment room.

The Small animal clinic has 15 consultation/examination rooms, amphitheatre for dermatology, internal medicine, surgery and theriogenology, anaesthetic and ophthalmic equipment, simulation models and materials, diagnostic dermatology equipment, a laboratory for analysis and microscopy, a pharmacy, nursing care room, 2 consultation rooms for surgery and reproduction, a workshop room for radiology and anatomy, a CT scanner, intern's room, radiology room and interpretation room and an anaesthesia and recovery room.

Within the SA clinic there was a unit designed to treat animals requiring chemotherapy, an intensive care unit with appropriate equipment and an isolation area. Animals being brought to the surgery at night entered through a dedicated entrance which then led to the intensive care ward. Orthopaedic operations were carried out at a different location and not on the same day as other surgical procedures. There was a small laboratory which was used during "out of hours" periods as required. During the day, all laboratory work was sent to the central pathology unit. A laundry facility was sited within the building and there was a room dedicated to the sterilisation and provision of autoclaved instruments etc.

The Ruminant clinical facility was designed and built before EU legislation relating to Biosecurity, Animal welfare and care standards was applicable. This facility is being decommissioned during the year 2020. It comprises an area of stalls and boxes which are used to house bovines and small ruminants. Three calf boxes were located on a concrete standing and used for potentially infected calves and small ruminants. Behind the main building there is a concrete path which leads to the second half of the facility containing pens and boxes. The isolation "unit" is located on the outside about 30 m off this way and is represented by an open pen with a roof with a neighbouring,

unprotected compost area open to the surroundings and no drainage for sewage waters.

The equine clinic was of a similar age with the Ruminant clinic and is divided in two halves, separated by the bovine unit and a small paddock which is used for equines. This receives intensive use and the removal of horse faeces on a regular basis. The X-ray area is old and complies with the relevant legislation, but includes two isolation boxes for the infectious cases at the far end. The equine isolation unit was located past these boxes and could only be accessed from the outside through a locked door.

Two rooms surface are available for the necropsy of dogs, cats, cattle and horses. There is a scale weighing items up to 150 kg, freezers and appropriate trolleys, chains and cleaning equipment.

The necropsy facility was situated away from the live animal facilities and was of recent construction. Changing rooms used for the students ensured that they had the appropriate clothing and boots before entering the facility. Procedures and well signed protocols ensured compliance. Boot cleaning equipment was available in the two necropsy rooms. The second was used for poultry post-mortems and contained a cabinet with appropriate ventilation and protective glass for potentially infectious disease cases.

Three multi-species slaughterhouses, located less than 80 km away from the Establishment are available. Also, five animal-based food processing premises are visited.

4.3.2. Comments

The small animal clinic was functional with a waiting room, reception area, separate wards for dogs and cats and internal medicine and surgery cases, promoting adequate welfare and management practices. The X-ray unit met the required standard and the CT scanner area was appropriately sited and signalled. The operating area was old but functional with a preparation room and theatres for various procedures. Consulting rooms for cats and dogs were separate with cat boxes being placed in a unit in the feline waiting room to maintain serenity for the patients. The consultation rooms could be darkened to permit ophthalmic examination and a red light was operated to prevent entrance to the consulting room during a feline consultation.

Due to its construction, in the Ruminant clinic the students have to enter the facility to access the changing room where they put on their protective clothing and boots and repeat the opposite procedure on their way out. The cleaning of the area is difficult. These facilities do not allow the implementation of best welfare and management practices as well as ensuring best biosecurity measures.

The fact that the X-ray building houses potentially infectious disease cases in two boxes at the far end of the building leads to passing by of other horses for treatment, cleaning or other purposes. The isolation box was not secured and there was insufficient signage or demarcation of the area. The equine paddock shared by all the patients is too small for intensive use and another paddock needs to be found to allow rotation of use.

4.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

The Establishment should further pursue the putting into service of the new buildings designated for the Ruminant clinic.

4.3.4. Decision

The Establishment is not compliant with Substandard 4.3 because the ruminant core clinical facility is not of adequate standard and does not promote the best husbandry, animal welfare, management and biosecurity practices.

4.4 Core clinical teaching facilities must be provided in a veterinary teaching hospital (VTH) with 24/7 emergency services at least for companion animals and equines. Within the VTH, the Establishment must unequivocally demonstrate that standard of education and clinical research are compliant with all ESEVT Standards, e.g. research-based and evidence-based

clinical training supervised by academic staff trained to teach and to assess, availability for staff and students of facilities and patients for performing clinical research and relevant QA procedures.

For ruminants, on-call service must be available if emergency services do not exist for those species in a VTH.

The Establishment must ensure state-of-the-art standards of teaching clinics which remain comparable with or exceeding the best available in the private sector.

The VTH and any hospitals, practices and facilities (including EPT) which are involved with the curriculum must meet the relevant national Practice Standards.

4.4.1. Findings

Core clinical training takes place in the VTH which has companion animal and equine hospitals, Large Animal Clinic and a Wildlife Care Centre. Ancillary services e.g. Pathology, are provided centrally for all disciplines.

Initially the facilities were built in 1965, but several buildings were built later. The Ruminant and Equine clinics are below the current standard of a teaching clinic. At the time of the inspection, 7 new surgical theatres and a new hospital for ruminants are under construction.

There are 20,000 consultations and 55,000 medical and surgical procedures annually.

Clinical research mainly consists of clinical trials, cohort studies and proofs of concept.

4.4.2. Comments

In the VTH students receive a research- and evidence-based training which is supervised by academic staff.

The small animal hospital provides a 24/7 service with interns and students present every night to attend to emergencies. The equine hospital does not provide a 24/7 service and there is an inadequate on-call service for ruminants.

The equine and ruminant clinics as described in Subsection 4.3.2 do not meet the biosecurity and animal welfare and care standards required and do not provide a “state of the art” standard.

The experience for students meets the required standard providing research- and evidence-based clinical training.

The VTH SA unit and other hospitals, practices and facilities meet the required national standards.

4.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

A 24/7 emergency service for equine and an adequate on-call service for emergency medicine in ruminants must be provided.

The efforts to replace the ruminant unit should be continued and the equine unit needs to be upgraded and replanned with regard to biosecurity and animal welfare and care (also see 4.3).

4.4.4. Decision

The Establishment is not compliant with Substandard 4.4 because of the absence of a 24/7 service for equine species at the VTH, an inadequate on-call service for ruminants and the absence of state-of-the-art standards in the ruminant and equine teaching clinics.

4.5 The Establishment must ensure that students have access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities, including but not limited to: diagnostic imaging, anaesthesia, clinical pathology, intensive/critical care, surgeries and treatment facilities, ambulatory services, pharmacy and necropsy facilities.

4.5.1. Findings

The Histology pathology laboratory contains the basic material to perform practical work, microscopes, centrifuges, scales and the equipment necessary to produce their slides.

The medical biology laboratory has biochemistry and haematology analysers, electrophoresis, virology materials, immunoanalysers, coloration equipment and anaesthetic equipment.

The imaging service has 2 X-ray generators and a CT scan for companion animals, an X-ray generator for equines and 2 portable X-ray generators for bovines and equids. Dedicated radiology areas are provided with appropriate viewing/interpretation areas.

Appropriate anaesthetic equipment is located in the ruminant, exotic pets and wildlife clinics, equine, small animal hospitals and the medical biology laboratory.

Clinical pathology laboratories with equipment for microscopy and laboratory analysis are located in the exotic/wildlife clinic, equine and companion animal clinics. There is a central transversal platform for necroscopy and histopathology.

There are 14 rooms available for intensive companion animal cases, with appropriate hospitalisation of isolation cases available and 1 box equine intensive care cases situated at a distance from all other patients. There is currently no dedicated isolation area for bovines. Should the need arise, animals are isolated in a quarantine box.

Consultation areas for the various species are listed in 4.3.1.

Herd health and reproduction case visits for bovines are provided with students transported in five nine-seater minibuses (1342 ruminants, 188 pigs, and 11 companion animals have been seen on average in the last three years).

There is a central pharmacy within the companion animal hospital with a subsidiary in the equine clinic, and medicine depots in bovine, exotic pets and wildlife clinics.

Two rooms surface area 390 m² are available in building 24 for the necroscopy of dogs, cats, cattle and horses. There is a scale weighing items up to 150 kg, freezers and appropriate trolleys, chains and cleaning equipment.

4.5.2. Comments

The histology laboratory only provides microscopes for 28 students necessitating eight repeated practical sessions by the lecturers to provide a demonstration to the whole class.

The Team identified that the data detailed in the SER does not indicate the real number of cages and boxes for small animal hospitalization. An amended list confirmed that the number of rooms and cages is appropriate for the clinical activity of the VTH and provides the animal housing.

The Establishment receives an average of 407 bovines each year within the clinic. There is no ambulatory clinic in operation in the facility but the students can practise field veterinary medicine and Herd Health Management under academic supervision on the farms during the extramural training. The vehicles listed are used for herd health and reproduction department visits.

4.5.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

4.5.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 4.5.

4.6 Appropriate isolation facilities must be provided to meet the need for the isolation and containment of animals with communicable diseases. Such isolation facilities must be properly constructed, ventilated, maintained and operated to provide for animal care and for prevention of spread of infectious agents. They must be adapted to all animal species commonly handled in the VTH.

4.6.1. Findings

The VTH has an appropriate SA isolation facility which includes a room dedicated to change from clean to infected clothing, a consultation room and two rooms with cages for potential cases. Procedures are in place to ensure pharmaceuticals and waste etc. are dealt with in the correct

manner.

The equine unit has an isolation box for equines and two boxes for low level potentially infected cases.

The ruminant isolation area is a pen situated 30 metres from the rear of the main bovine buildings. Calves with potentially infectious or contagious diseases are housed in calf boxes located on a concrete pad near to the main isolation pen.

4.6.2. Comments

The Ruminant isolation facilities (quarantine box and calf boxes) are well below the best standard. They consist of an open sided pen with a roof located separate from other buildings. At the time of the inspection the pen, which was not in use, contained potentially contaminated straw and dung which was also spreading out of the confines of the area. There was no signage or delineation of the area to indicate that it could contain potentially infectious or contagious disease cases. Similarly, the calf boxes were not identified or contained within a demarcated area. No signs represented a potential biohazard or gave instructions as to procedures to be followed.

The equine isolation box was located away from other horses with a locked door. Entering from the opposite of the same building there are two boxes for lower risk isolation cases, but these communicated with other boxes, being separated inappropriately. The main box was improperly signed, was not demarcated, had passive ventilation, which could allow contact to the other parts of the building, waste fluids were transmitted to a decontamination unit common to all buildings. Solid waste is destroyed by an independent and licensed contractor.

The two indoor, lesser risk boxes could only be accessed by passing other horse boxes and the X-ray unit which could pose a risk. Ventilation is passive, and fluid and solid waste removal is as in the outer isolation box. Solid material has to pass other boxes as it is removed. There are no signs indicating procedures, demarcation of area etc.

Signs in the SA isolation unit giving directions about biosecurity and procedures to be followed need to be posted.

4.6.3. Suggestions for improvement

The ruminant isolation box is being replaced and sited within a new building. Thought should be given to ensuring that such cases do not have to pass other animals on the way to the isolation unit.

The equine facility in both the lesser infective areas and the isolation box need rethinking with care and attention being given to ventilation, disposal of waste, demarcation of areas and prevention of contact between isolation cases and other stock. Signage should be appropriate.

4.6.4. Decision

The Establishment is not compliant with Substandard 4.6 because of inadequacy of isolation facilities for equine and ruminant species.

4.7 The Establishment must have an ambulatory clinic for production animals or equivalent facilities so that students can practise field veterinary medicine and Herd Health Management under academic supervision.

4.7.1. Findings

The Establishment has five nine-seater minibus type vehicles widely used to transport students to farms to practice field reproductive veterinary medicine and Herd Health Management.

4.7.2. Comments

The Establishment provides the students with experience of clinical activity on several farms jointly provided by external practitioners and the members of the academic staff. Herd Health Management is provided with appropriate academic supervision. Agreements with most of the farms are informal

and not under contractual obligation.

4.7.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

4.7.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 4.7.

4.8 The transport of students, live animals, cadavers, materials from animal origin and other teaching materials must be done in agreement with national and EU standards, to ensure the safety of students and staff and to prevent the spread of infectious agents.

4.8.1. Findings

ENVT has a fleet of 9 light vehicles (minibuses) used for the transport of students.

Live animals and cadavers are transported in two vehicles by certificated drivers and the vehicles are inspected by the Departmental Directorate for Public Security (DD SP).

4.8.2. Comments

The vehicles for transportation for the animals are cleaned and disinfected in a specific designated area. This activity is undertaken; however there is no evidence of this activity in a register located in the office or within the vehicles.

4.8.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

4.8.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 4.8.

4.9 Operational policies and procedures (including e.g. biosecurity, good laboratory practice and good clinical practice) must be taught and posted for students, staff and visitors and a Biosafety manual must be available. The Establishment must demonstrate a clear commitment for the delivery of biosafety and biosecurity, e.g. by a specific committee structure. The Establishment must have a system of QA to monitor and assure clinical, laboratory and farm services, including a regular monitoring of the feedback from students, staff and clients.

4.9.1. Findings

The Establishment has a biosecurity and biosafety manual which is available to staff and students. This information is also available using Moodle. Students are given instruction by the departments at the start of their period use of the facilities. QA monitoring occurs and procedures are written for laboratory and farm services.

4.9.2. Comments

The posting of biosecurity information was inconsistent, being good in the necropsy unit, the small animal chemotherapy unit and insufficiently visible in areas such as the small animal, equine and ruminant isolation areas.

The rules are not strictly followed by all the students and personnel. Some students were observed wearing SA hospital protective clothing outside the building taking patients for a walk.

4.9.3. Suggestions for improvement

The provision of simplified (such as with icons) biosecurity instructions posted in all areas of the

Establishment would heighten awareness and compliance with biosecurity and biosafety instructions by all users. The isolation units are of particular concern but all areas require careful thought and attention.

Biosecurity instructions should be posted also in English to assist foreign students and other visitors on exchange programmes.

4.9.4. Decision

The Establishment is partially compliant with Sub-standard 4.9 because of sub-optimal posting of biosecurity signs in some areas where students are trained.

Standard 5: Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin

5.1 The number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin must be adequate for providing the practical and safe hands-on training (in the areas of Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Pathology, Animal Production, Food Safety and Quality) and adapted to the number of students enrolled. Evidence must be provided that these data are regularly recorded and that procedures are in place for correcting any deficiencies.

5.1.1. Findings

For companion animals and equines, clinical training is based on the VTH that operates both as a general veterinary practice and as referral. Patients seen intra-murally include all animal species which are in sufficient numbers, except for pigs which are seen only extra-murally (mainly during EPT). As regards pre-clinical training (physiology, animal production, propaedeutics), healthy live animals used for training include all species, except pigs which are mainly seen during EPT. Ruminants clinical training is provided through cattle admitted at the Ruminant Hospital and via veterinary practitioners who solicit examination of cases in farm audits (carried out with 3rd, 4th and 5th year students). As regards anatomy training, cadavers and conserved anatomic pieces are utilized; however, no whole carcasses of cattle, pigs and -only really a few- equine carcasses are reportedly used. As regards pathology training, the cadavers used are mostly necropsies of diseased animals which died on the farms, at the VTH or were euthanized at the hospital. External veterinarians also bring cadavers for post-mortem examinations, using the services of the Establishment, although the number of equine cadavers remains low. All carcasses used for training in anatomy and pathology are duly removed by a rendering/removal company responsible for their destruction. Training in FSQ and VPH is performed extramurally at multispecies abattoirs and during supervised activities with VPH officers during their routine work. Data on animal resources used for training are routinely recorded and procedures to correct deficiencies are in place.

5.1.2. Comments

There is a constant goal to maintain a sufficient caseload both in companion animals, exotics and equines, and in food-producing animals, with respect to intramural and extramural cases (ambulatory clinics and EPT). The method/system to introduce 13 cows every year into the school and subject to reproduction is a very useful opportunity to do the practicals in physiology and semiology of the genital system, and this is commendable. To support the lack of anatomical pieces and carcasses for some species -especially horses- anatomical training can rely on an extensive collection of pieces preserved at the Anatomy Museum. Learning of anatomical concepts has evolved from the conventional approach to anatomy based on dissection: a variety of complementary dynamic imaging has been introduced placing anatomy in a clinical context. All procedures to obtain, prepare, store and destroy the cadavers and material of animal origin -as described- are considered satisfactory.

Overall, the number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin -as reported- is considered adequate to provide the practical and safe hands-on training and appropriate for the number of students enrolled, except for the number of equine necropsies (I19 shows a negative balance) as well as the overall number of whole horses carcasses for anatomy training.

5.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

The same suggestions for improvement proposed in the SER (i.e. a dedicated platform for equine necropsies and information to horse owners -in agreement with their vets- to send the carcasses of dead horses to the campus for post-mortem, plus making the necropsy platform more visible and attractive in the next years) seem feasible and sustainable. Some whole equine carcasses could be bought from abattoirs to improve anatomy teaching also on splancology.

5.1.4. Decision

The Establishment is partially compliant with Substandard 5.1 because of a sub-optimal number and variety of cadavers for anatomy and necropsy.

5.2 In addition to the training provided in the Establishment, experience can include practical training at external sites, provided this training is organised under direct academic supervision and following the same standards as those applied in the Establishment.

5.2.1. Findings

Each student must complete a mandatory period abroad. Sessions of practical training for 1st year students (now for 2nd year students) are organized at a teaching farm in Bernussou (Villefranche-de-Rouergue). Here, the students spend 1 or 2 days to receive training in animal husbandry: pig farming (feeding, reproduction, farrowing), dairy cattle production (through a specific workshop on milking) and dairy farming (nutrition, housing). Students must validate at least 14 weeks of External Practical Training (EPT) before the beginning of their 5th year. EPT is supervised by the academic staff and assessed with written and oral examinations. Fields of practice for EPTs include Large Animals (pre-clinical and clinical), FSQ & VPH. For each EPT, the student must have a referring teacher, who approves the location and the subject and implements a method of assessment (oral interview, written report, and/or oral report). EPT is generally carried out outside the periods of compulsory teaching and is subjected to an EPT agreement. In the 5th year, the duration, period and topic of the mandatory EPT depend on the chosen major. It permits to complete clinical knowledge and practice and is mandatory to validate the 5th year.

5.2.2. Comments

The compulsory stage abroad is highly commendable as it allows promoting of the students' international perspective. Also, the possibility given to students to carry out an optional EPT (min. duration: 1 week) is commendable. The fact that a database of EPT locations and tutors -accessible to all students- has been built, and that students are encouraged to actively and autonomously search for their EPT places and themes taking into account the specifications defined for each EPT, is commendable.

The high proportion of practical and clinical training is definitely a strength of the Establishment. Although very demanding in terms of supervision, this training approach enables a good hands-on practice. ENVV anticipates that a mandatory EPT in private pet clinic(s) as part of the 4th year clinical rotations is under discussion. It would increase students' clinical exposure to first-opinion cases and allow a useful experience in practice management. Students who choose the major "Large animal medicine" have the opportunity to do a 18-20 week "*stage tutoré*" (tutored training), alternating periods in a clinic and periods of academic training at ENVV (3 periods of 6 weeks each, interspersed with 2-week periods at ENVV). A veterinary clinic located in a rural area can welcome

a 5th year students and contribute to strengthening the network of veterinarians in those areas. A “*stage tutoré*” is based on a strong relation between the student, the mentor and an ENVT lecturer. Overall the EPT system implemented by the ENVT is efficient and supports student-focused education.

5.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

5.2.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 5.2.

5.3 The VTH must provide nursing care skills and instruction in nursing procedures. Under all situations students must be active participants in the clinical workup of patients, including problem-oriented diagnostic approach together with diagnostic decision-making

5.3.1. Findings

Skills in small animal's hygiene and nursing are acquired by undergraduate students during 1-week rotation at the VTH (small animal hospital), during consultations and hospitalization of patients. The clinical and nursing skills -including those in large animals- include clinical examination, animal restraint, bandaging, clinical laboratory (injections, blood sampling, urine analysis), hygiene. These nursing care skills are taught by the vet nurses of the small animal hospital; besides, students have the possibility to practice some of the clinical/nursing skills using pet manikins (both standard and home-made) freely available for them. Clinical workup of patients is organized on a daily basis, to allow interaction with a senior clinician. During these exchanges, different cases are discussed, with emphasis on active contribution by the students on diagnostic decision-making. A problem-oriented diagnostic approach together with diagnostic decision-making is provided for all students, both for companion animals, NAC and equine, as well as for food producing animals.

5.3.2. Comments

Nursing care skills are provided and the methodology put in place to actively involve the students in the clinical workup of patients -as described- is very satisfactory. The active participation of students in the clinical workgroups is facilitated by the adequate group size for the different types of clinical training (both intra-murally and extra-murally). Whenever possible the number of animals available for clinical training and for hands-on activities is adjusted to the group size in order to enable each student to perform the necessary acts under the supervision of the lecturer/tutor.

Commendable is the mentoring/tutoring system put in place by the Establishment according to which younger students are mentored by more advanced students (i.e. 3rd year students are mentored by 4th year students, and 4th year are mentored by last year students).

5.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

5.3.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 5.3.

5.4 Medical records must be comprehensive and maintained in an effective retrieval system (preferably an electronic patient record system) to efficiently support the teaching, research, and service programmes of the Establishment.

5.4.1. Findings

For small animals, equines, exotic pets and wildlife, the system used by ENVT to record the patients is Clovis, a software adopted in 2001 and used in all French ENVs. It allows a complete retrieval of demographic info, case management, and administrative information (e.g. billing), and can also be used for retrospective studies. For ruminants, the ENVT has adopted an in-house record system, based on Filemaker. Each incoming animal is assigned an ID/Ref. number which is related to the owner's and the referring veterinarian's names, animal ID (tag number, species, breed, sex, age), main complaint, admission/discharge dates, hospital care follow-up and exit report (outgoing animals), necropsy report, and the name of 5th year students/interns/lecturer, etc. The system allows to manage cases and herd information, and to retrieve statistical data. Additionally, VetelevageVetoexpert, a suit developed for SNGTV (a vet continuous learning association) is used to collect data on animals examined during reproduction monitoring visits. Finally, poultry and swine cases are recorded (each case has an ID) on a PC server (Excel files) of the clinics for poultry and swine.

5.4.2. Comments

ENVT utilizes three different systems to record patients (Clovis, Filemaker Bovine, and an Excel based database) for the animal various species, plus an additional one called Vetelevage/Vetoexpert. Medical records from Clovis and FileMakers can be accessed and consulted by staff members and by students at the VTH although only through the local PCs and servers (different access privileges are provided), not from remote ones. Clovis and Filemaker Bovine systems seem to guarantee an efficient support to the teaching, research, and service programmes of ENVT, although the systems are integrated. As mentioned, the ENVT may in the future attempt to implement a single integrated system for patient records for all species.

5.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

5.4.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 5.4.

Standard 6: Learning resources

6.1 State-of-the-art learning resources must be adequate and available to support veterinary education, research, services and continuing education. When the study programme is provided in several tracks/languages, the learning resources must be available in all used languages. Timely access to learning resources, whether through print, electronic media or other means, must be available to students and staff and, when appropriate, to stakeholders. State-of-the-art procedures for bibliographical search and for access to databases and learning resources must be taught to undergraduate students.

6.1.1. Findings

Wi-Fi is available over the whole campus, a VPN using Moodle allows students 24/7 hr access to Video teaching and the library. A video studio enabling students to simulate animal handling and technical procedures is provided though the skills lab located in the anatomy department may supersede this necessity. The study programme is taught only in French.

The centrally placed library offers voluntary 2 hr training sessions on scientific literature search Jeudi Bibli with an uptake of 38 in 2017/18 and 60 in 2019/20. Training is more advanced using Zotero bibliographic referencing software available to the students 24/7. Twenty tutorials are

available at any time using Moodle and the Biblio Tech INP documentary portal is designed as an information and self training tool leading to better understanding of the documentary resources and improving the use of research practices and information.

ENVT has pooled its resources on its integration into INPT SCD allowing financial savings while offering more documentation.

Learning resources are evaluated each year statistically and the documentary policy adapted accordingly.

6.1.2. Comments

The library is consistently used by students, 31041 visits in 2018. The video studio, along with the other similar sized room also serve as a study room for up to 10 students and both are used heavily, especially during examination periods. Search engines and procedures for bibliographic research were demonstrated. Students reported that the Wi-Fi and Moodle allowed 24 hour access to learning processes on and off campus.

6.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

6.1.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 6.1.

6.2 Staff and students must have full access on site to an academic library administered by a qualified librarian, an Information Technology (IT) unit managed by an IT expert, an e-learning platform, and all the relevant human and physical resources necessary for the development of instructional materials by the staff and their use by the students.

The relevant electronic information, database and other intranet resources must be easily available for students and staff both in the Establishment's core facilities via wireless connection (Wi-Fi) and from outside the Establishment through a hosted secured connection, e.g. Virtual Private Network (VPN).

6.2.1. Findings

The Librarian is fully qualified, and the library has 2.8 FTE staff including an IT specialist plus 4 student part time helpers. It is closed on Saturday afternoons and Sundays and closes at 19:00 during the week or 20:00 during exam periods.

The library has over 26000 veterinary books, 46 printed journals and many e-subscriptions to other journals plus access to 1371 veterinary e-books. INP subscription increases this to access more than 35,000 e-books and 10000 e-periodicals. Wi-Fi (Moodle) provides 24 hr access to electronic journals and scientific data using the VPN both on and off site.

Seven computers are provided; it is a requirement of the Establishment that all students have their own laptop.

6.2.2. Comments

Students report that the number of informative books and programmes provided by the library is adequate for their study requirements. There are seven rooms for small numbers of students and two larger rooms for groups up to 10 students to work together. There is time pressure on the use of these rooms with booking essential at peak periods.

Simulation laboratories were provided in various departments but are now concentrated in one laboratory in the anatomy department.

6.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

6.2.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 6.2.

6.3 The Establishment must provide students with unimpeded access to learning resources, internet and internal study resources, and equipment for the development of procedural skills (e.g. models). The use of these resources must be aligned with the pedagogical environment and learning outcomes within the programme and have mechanisms in place to evaluate the teaching value of changes in learning resources.

6.3.1. Findings

Wi-Fi and the VPN using Moodle provide the students with 24 hr access to learning. The library has access during stated hours but is closed for the weekend after Saturday lunch time. There is a skills laboratory with models assisting the learning of procedural skills. These include bovine, equine and canine obstetric models, thoracic intubation mannequins for canines and felines, skin suturing models, pre surgery skin models and venipuncture models.

6.3.2. Comments

Access to learning resources via Wi-Fi and Moodle is unimpeded and available on a 24/7 hr access. The skills laboratory is a recent addition and is appreciated by the students. Staff are very enthusiastic and have developed models for skin incision, suturing techniques and bovine obstetric situations.

6.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

6.3.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 6.3.

Standard 7: Student admission, progression and welfare

7.1 The Establishment must consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student “life cycle”, e.g. student admission, progression and certification.

In relation to enrolment, the Establishment must provide accurate and complete information regarding all aspects of the educational programme in all advertisings for prospective national and international students.

Formal cooperations with other Establishments must also be clearly advertised.

7.1.1. Findings

Selection for the admission to the Establishment is through a competitive entrance examination organised at national level for all veterinary schools in France. Two or three years of study after Baccalaureat is required. (However, from 2021 it will be possible to enrol right after Baccalaureat with a preparatory year at the Establishment). There are six types of entrance examinations depending on the previous studies of the applicant.

Foreign students do not sit for an entrance exam, but they must possess a diploma of at least two years of university studies. Besides they must pass an annual exam organised by the Ministry of Agriculture. An applicant may only sit for the entrance examination twice.

There is adequate and extensive information regarding the entrance examination and admission process both on a site run by the Service des Concours Agronomiques et Vétérinaires and on the Establishment's website. The latter also offers guides for both French and foreign students (in

French only) on how to enrol and start their student life. The Establishment regularly organises open days and participates in job fairs for the benefit of would-be students.

Co-operative partners are visible on the Establishment's website, and indication of its EAEVE accreditation is provided (<http://a3ev.envt.fr/menu-og-31/accréditation-2015-2020>).

7.1.2. Comments

The high pre-requisites of admission ensure the possibility to select the best students, with high intellectual capacities and motivation that has a beneficial influence on their progression.

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.1 because the student life cycle is transparently and exhaustively regulated.

7.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

7.1.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.1.

7.2 The number of students admitted must be consistent with the resources available at the Establishment for staff, buildings, equipment, healthy and diseased animals, and materials of animal origin.

7.2.1. Findings

The number of admitted students is set by the MAA. There seems to be an increasing need for veterinarians in France, thus the number of admitted students has increased with 35% since 2012. Though it is not easy, the Establishment copes with this magnitude of students.

7.2.2. Comments

The Establishment is not free to decide on the number of admitted students. However, indicators show that there is generally a balance between the number of students and the available resources.

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.2 because it is able to provide resources for the allocated number of students.

7.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

7.2.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.2.

7.3 The selection and progression criteria must be clearly defined, consistent, and defensible, be free of discrimination or bias, and take into account the fact that students are admitted with a view to their entry to the veterinary profession in due course.

The Establishment must regularly review and reflect on the selection processes to ensure they are appropriate for students to complete the programme successfully. If the selection processes are decided by another authority, the latter must regularly receive feedback from the Establishment.

Adequate training (including periodic refresher training) must be provided for those involved in the selection process to ensure applicants are evaluated fairly and consistently.

7.3.1. Findings

The entrance examination is organised by the MAA who does the ranking of students as well. There are 4–5 times as many applicants as admitted first year students to the veterinary schools. The

Establishment only participates in the boards of examiners, and there are some involved in the oral selection tests. Due to the diversity of entrance possibilities (six altogether) students from different socio-professional backgrounds may enter the Establishment. A student may apply no more than two times for admission to a vet school. In case of failure there are other schools open for those who cannot get into veterinary training (also due to the high number of candidates as compared to available places in the first year.)

Since admission is regulated by MAA only the Deans of the veterinary schools have the opportunity to propose changes on meetings organized with the Department for Higher Education and Research and MAA.

7.3.2. Comments

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.3 as far as it is applicable, since it participates in the entrance examination to a very small extent, but has the possibility to propose changes to the organizing authorities.

7.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

7.3.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.3.

7.4 There must be clear policies and procedures on how applicants with disabilities or illnesses are considered and, if appropriate, accommodated in the programme, taking into account the requirement that all students must be capable of meeting the ESEVT Day One Competences by the time they graduate.

7.4.1. Findings

There is a possibility for the adjustment of the entrance exams for students with disabilities. Once registered, the problems of the student are identified, and DEVE informs the Interuniversity Service for Preventive Medicine and Health Promotion (SIMPSS) about the case. The physician of SIMPSS makes recommendations for the special adaptation of the curriculum and methods suited for the student with special needs which are included in the teaching contract. In case of a disease, it is possible to cancel a semester or year.

7.4.2. Comments

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.4 because the possibilities for students with disabilities and illnesses are clearly regulated, and also included in their contract.

7.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

7.4.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.4.

7.5 The basis for decisions on progression (including academic progression and professional fitness to practise) must be explicit and readily available to the students. The Establishment must provide evidence that it has mechanisms in place to identify and provide remediation and appropriate support (including termination) for students who are not performing adequately.

The Establishment must have mechanisms in place to monitor attrition and progression and be able to respond and amend admission selection criteria (if permitted by national or university law) and student support if required.

7.5.1. Findings

Procedures and criteria for progression are included in the academic regulations, and subject descriptions (syllabus) are updated annually. In order to proceed from one module to the next, the student must obtain a final grade of the module min. 10/20. With less than 5/20 in a discipline, the student must sit for the re-take session test.

With one failed semester, the student can proceed to the next year to validate failed courses, and can in the meantime follow courses of the other semester of the year n+1. With two failed semesters the whole year must be repeated (both semesters). Repetition of a semester is allowed only once.

Students failing a module equivalent to less than 8 ECTS will be allowed to proceed, and have to attend the examination sessions of modules failed. If they fail again, they have to repeat the semester.

According to article 33 of the study regulations, the Teachers' Council discusses the problems of students not performing adequately. Solutions are proposed and fixed in a contract between DEVE and the student.

7.5.2. Comments

The 95% of students finish their studies without any delay.

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.5 because there are mechanisms in place to follow up the performance of students, and – if necessary – provide remediation.

7.5.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

7.5.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.5.

7.6 Mechanisms for the exclusion of students from the programme for any reason must be explicit.

The Establishment's policies for managing appeals against decisions, including admissions, academic and progression decisions and exclusion, must be transparent and publicly available.

7.6.1. Findings

Disciplinary matters, mechanisms and appeal procedures are adequately described in the academic regulations.

After retakes, problems may be forwarded to CEVE through the Dean or Head of Education and Student life department.

Any serious misconduct of a student is referred to the disciplinary committee of the Board of Directors. Sanctions may be temporary or permanent exclusion as defined by Article 45 of the academic regulation. Exclusion may follow in case of insufficient academic performance if the student has to triple one semester. The final decision is taken by the Board of Directors. Appeals can be submitted to the mediator for agricultural education, to the minister or a court.

7.6.2. Comments

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.6 because it has transparent and published regulations for exclusions and appeals.

7.6.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

7.6.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.6.

7.7 Provisions must be made by the Establishment to support the physical, emotional and welfare needs of students. This includes, but is not limited to, learning support and counselling services, career advice, and fair and transparent mechanisms for dealing with student illness, impairment and disability during the programme. This shall include provision of reasonable adjustments for disabled students, consistent with all relevant equality and/or human rights legislation.

There must be effective mechanisms for resolution of student grievances (e.g. interpersonal conflict or harassment).

7.7.1. Findings

The campus offers ideal circumstances for student life, including residence (252 places), catering, sports and recreation.

A full-time staff member deals with student welfare, and social grants. He interacts with the students' association (Amicale with 38 clubs). There is a compulsory medical check for newcomers provided by the doctor of SIMPPS.

Students are represented in several councils, and they are running facilities upon a convention signed by the Dean annually.

In matters of training, direct interaction with module heads is possible. Students with poor performance may turn to DEVE to find out about the causes of failure, and find the appropriate remedy (medical, financial, social, etc.). After retakes problems may be forwarded to CEVE which discusses the problem with the module head, and forwards the conclusions to the Academic Board for decision. Systematic assessment of training by students is provided for. In other grievances the monthly meetings between the Amicale board and the Dean's staff or direct solicitation are the forums available for students. In case of social problems, financial support may be asked for among others from the alumni of the Establishment.

7.7.2. Comments

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.7 because there is an extensive system for providing aid for students with different types of difficulties. Students' social life, and students' relation to the staff is excellent.

7.7.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

7.7.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.7.

7.8 Mechanisms must be in place by which students can convey their needs and wants to the Establishment. The Establishment must provide students with a mechanism, anonymously if they wish, to offer suggestions, comments and complaints regarding compliance of the Establishment with national and international legislation and the ESEVT standards.

7.8.1. Findings

Students are represented in several bodies of the Establishment. There is a monthly meeting between Amicale and the Dean's office. It is possible for any student to book a lunch with the Dean

once a month and directly discuss any matter.

7.8.2. Comments

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.8 because it has mechanisms for conveying student needs to the Establishment. The student-oriented attitude of staff, and that students are not embarrassed to approach teachers with their problems is remarkable.

7.8.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

7.8.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 7.8.

Standard 8: Student assessment

8.1 The Establishment must ensure that there is a clearly identified structure within the Establishment showing lines of responsibility for the assessment strategy to ensure coherence of the overall assessment regime and to allow the demonstration of progressive development across the programme towards entry-level competence.

8.1.1. Findings

There is a variety of assessment strategies in place ranging from oral exams to different types of written exams. Oral examinations are public and evaluated by two lecturers. Most of the examinations are written due to the number of students. Assessment is also performed during group work on certain theoretical and practical tasks. At the end of each semester, the final exams take place. The students have sufficient time to prepare for these exams. The calculation of the grades is based on the ECTS credits. The syllabus of each course provides a detailed description of the learning objectives and the form of the exam. Criteria of progression are explicitly communicated to the students.

8.1.2. Comments

The ENVT provides a well-structured assessment scheme with clear regulation concerning progression of students following examinations. Small group assessment provides a valuable method to assess theoretical and practical skills as well as various soft skills. The syllabus of each topic gives extensive information regarding learning outcomes and competencies to be achieved.

8.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

8.1.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 8.1.

8.2 The assessment tasks and grading criteria for each unit of study in the programme must be published, applied consistently, clearly identified and available to students in a timely manner well in advance of the assessment. Requirements to pass must be explicit.

The Establishment must properly document the results of assessment and provide the students with timely feedback on their assessments.

Mechanisms for students to appeal against assessment outcomes must be explicit.

8.2.1. Findings

The assessment procedures are described sufficiently in the module-specific syllabus. Information concerning requirements to pass individual exams is given. The requirements to proceed to next semesters are explicit. Regulations concerning repeating exams, sickness during examination periods and repeating semesters are available to the students. All exams are controlled by the Dean and the academic council.

8.2.2. Comments

All exams are announced at the beginning of each term. The syllabus provides excellent information regarding all aspects of assessment. The awarding of grades is transparent. Each exam is evaluated after the exams.

8.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

8.2.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 8.2.

8.3 The Establishment must have a process in place to review assessment outcomes, to change assessment strategies and to ensure the accuracy of the procedures when required. Programme learning outcomes covering the full range of professional knowledge, skills, competences and attributes must form the basis for assessment design and underpin decisions on progression.

8.3.1. Findings

There are learning objectives available to provide all students with sufficient information regarding requested knowledge and basic skills. Several committees (CEVE, academic council and Board of Directors) evaluate the assessment strategies and their outcomes. The close contact of students and lecturers during clinical years provides an optimal monitoring system.

8.3.2. Comments

There is a very good communication of all assessments to students. The syllabus clearly defines the assessment strategies and provides a link between learning outcomes and assessment strategies.

The evaluation of each exam with the possibility to discuss the evaluation results with the teachers or with the CEVE provides valuable method to change assessment methods.

8.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

8.3.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 8.3.

8.4 Assessment strategies must allow the Establishment to certify student achievement of learning objectives at the level of the programme and individual units of study.

The Establishment must ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.

8.4.1. Findings

The ENVT's matrix mapping competences and sub-competences to the learning objectives provides an excellent framework to monitor student achievement and their progression in the different

semesters.

The overall curriculum provides a framework encouraging students to be active and reflective learners. This is particularly true for years 3 to 5.

8.4.2. Comments

The tutoring system of more advanced students guiding younger students provides a very good basis for active learning and teaching experiences. It also enhances soft skills, such as communication skills, dealing with pressure, positive mental attitude etc.

8.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

8.4.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 8.4.

8.5 Methods of formative and summative assessment must be valid and reliable and comprise a variety of approaches. Direct assessment of clinical skills and Day One Competences (some of which may be on simulated patients), must form a significant component of the overall process of assessment. It must also include the quality control of the student logbooks in order to ensure that all clinical procedures, practical and hands-on training planned in the study programme have been fully completed by each individual student.

8.5.1. Findings

There are sufficient methods and offers for self-assessment. Day One Competences are assessed throughout the clinical rotations. There are formative and summative assessments.

Case logs are present on the Clovis and Filemaker software. The students can retrieve their achievement in these programs. Assessment is performed by the teachers in the systems.

8.5.2. Comments

In some clinics, there are clinical case recordings (Clovis, Filemaker) that have to be filled by each student, however, there is sub-optimal use of a logbook system for recording of clinical skills.

8.5.3. Suggestions for improvement

It is suggested that the electronic system for logbooks with Day One Competences that is in construction to be used in all French Vet Schools is introduced.

8.5.4. Decision

The Establishment is partially compliant with Substandard 8.5 because of sub-optimal use of a logbook system for recording of clinical skills.

Standard 9: Academic and support staff

9.1 The Establishment must ensure that all staff are appropriately qualified and prepared for their roles, in agreement with national and EU regulations and must apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of staff.

A formal training (including good teaching and evaluation practices, learning and e-learning resources, biosecurity and QA procedures) must be in place for all staff involved with teaching. Most academic staff (calculated as FTE) involved in veterinary training must be veterinarians. It is expected that more than 2/3 of the instruction that the students receive, as determined by student teaching hours, is delivered by qualified veterinarians.

9.1.1. Findings

Staff recruitment (teaching and support staff) at ENVT is governed by national regulations and it is based on a so-called “job expertise” procedure that guarantees that all staff recruited is appropriately qualified and prepared for the role. Also, the temporary lecturers and staff members, and contractual staff members are selected according to strict national rules and the rules set by the Establishment itself. As the various selection and enrolment procedures for teaching staff (lecturers, associate professors and full professors) are particularly long and complex to be described and be commented here, it is suggested to refer to the relevant sub-standards in the SER for detailed information.

The ENVT provides adequate formal training for all staff involved in teaching (both academic and support staff); in particular the following training topics are provided: good teaching practices and evaluation; e-learning resources; biosecurity and biosafety regulations and QA procedures.

Finally, the large majority of the academic staff involved in veterinary training (calculated as FTE) are veterinarians. Moreover, 75% of the instruction that the students receive -as determined by student teaching hours detailed in the SER- is delivered by qualified veterinarians.

9.1.2. Comments

The recruitment and development of staff apply fair and transparent processes and are in agreement with national and EU regulations. The fact that each new lecturer is accompanied by 3 tutor lecturers during a 1-year trial period to evaluate teaching, research and services provided is commendable. Moreover, a 4-week (full-time) pedagogical training programme, organised at national level to provide teaching theory and new teaching technologies to all new teachers - including also professors who did not have the opportunity to follow this programme in the past - represents an added value. Besides that, Toulouse University organizes short pedagogical training programmes each year to which lecturers of all member institutions -including ENVT- are invited to participate: such courses/training programmes are a solid basis to assure that all ENVT teachers have a formal training in good teaching and evaluation practices, learning and e-learning resources, and this is also commendable.

Overall, the Establishment has put in place all measures to meet the requisites of Substandard 9.1 and it has also planned further steps for improvement.

9.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

9.1.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 9.1.

9.2 The total number, qualifications and skills of all staff involved with the programme, including teaching staff, ‘adjunct’ staff, technical, administrative and support staff, must be sufficient and appropriate to deliver the educational programme and fulfil the Establishment’s mission.

A procedure must be in place to assess if the staff involved with teaching display competence and effective teaching skills in all relevant aspects of the curriculum that they teach, regardless of whether they are full or part time, residents, interns or other postgraduate students, adjuncts or off-campus contracted teachers.

9.2.1. Findings

The number and composition of the academic staff (ref. Table 9.2.1. and Stand_9.1_App001), support staff (ref. Table 9.2.3) of the veterinary programme, as well as the research staff of the Establishment (ref. Table 9.2.4) -calculated as FTE- is sufficient to deliver the educational programme. The ESEVT indicator, I2 (n. of FTE vets involved in veterinary training/n. of students

graduating annually) is close to the median values. There is a procedure to assess whether all staff involved with teaching (i.e. full or part time staff, residents, interns or other postgrad students, adjuncts or off-campus contracted teachers) is able to display competence and effective teaching skills in all relevant aspects of the curriculum taught.

9.2.2. Comments

Although the total number, qualifications and skills of the staff involved in the programme are sufficient and appropriate to deliver the educational programme, it has to be pointed out that the ENVT still faces some challenges. As reported in the SER and pointed out during the interviews, there are some difficulties to recruit specific competencies (both for lecturers and technical or administrative staff) in the equine sector, which remains partially in deficit of qualified personnel despite the current intensive recruitment efforts. A long-term strategy to reinforce this sector is already foreseen to build and maintain a strong equine clinical team in order to provide students sufficient number of cases and a qualified specific training in hippiatry.

9.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

It is strongly suggested that the Establishment recruits as soon as possible additional academic and support staff in the equine clinic.

9.2.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 9.2.

9.3 Staff must be given opportunities to develop and extend their teaching and assessment knowledge and must be encouraged to improve their skills. Opportunities for didactic and pedagogic training and specialisation must be available. The Establishment must clearly define any systems of reward for teaching excellence in operation.

Academic positions must offer the security and benefits necessary to maintain stability, continuity, and competence of the academic staff. They must have a balanced workload of teaching, research and service depending on their role. They must have reasonable opportunities and resources for participation in scholarly activities.

9.3.1. Findings

Opportunities are provided to the staff to develop and extend their teaching and assessment knowledge; *ad hoc* didactic and pedagogic training courses are available for teaching staff as already described in the Findings and Comments sections of Substandard 9.1, to which reference should be made. Staff is reportedly offered the necessary security and benefits to maintain stability and continuity in the respective academic positions; the system of reward for teaching excellence is set at national level according to the legislation and procedures in force.

The activity of lecturers and their workload -sub-divided in teaching, research and service- is equally balanced between research (50%) and teaching (50%, including services) according to the specific government decree. Staff also have opportunities (and resources) to participate in scholarly activities (i.e. organized clinical discussions, rounds, journal clubs, and conferences).

9.3.2. Comments

The fact that ENVT makes working-time arrangements for lecturers wishing to prepare for academic examination, for a tenure or promotion competition is highly commendable.

9.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

9.3.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 9.3.

9.4 The Establishment must provide evidence that it utilises a well-defined, comprehensive and publicised programme for the professional growth and development of academic and support staff, including formal appraisal and informal mentoring procedures.

Staff must have the opportunity to contribute to the Establishment's direction and decision-making processes.

Promotion criteria for academic and support staff must be clear and explicit. Promotions for teaching staff must recognise excellence in, and (if permitted by the national or university law) place equal emphasis on all aspects of teaching (including clinical teaching), research, service and other scholarly activities.

9.4.1. Findings

The modalities for professional training of staff refer to a Ministerial Memorandum (ref. n. SG/SRH/SDDPRS/2019-554 of 23 July 2019). The programme for the professional growth and development of academic and support staff, which the Establishment utilises, is set and regulated by the national legislation. Such programme includes also formal appraisal and informal mentoring procedures. Staff has the opportunity to participate in decision-making processes and contribute to the Establishment's direction through direct participation in the decisional bodies or indirectly through the elected representatives for the different staff categories. The promotion criteria for academic and support staff are set and regulated by the national legislation: such criteria recognise excellence for teaching staff, and equal emphasis is put on teaching (50%), on research and service (50%).

9.4.2. Comments

Promotion criteria for academic and support staff (i.e. annual professional interview with the supervisor, promotion campaign, working time adjustment) are available; being defined by the national legislation, these criteria must be known to all categories of the staff. Opportunities for institutional or informal exchanges between ENVT's management and the staff and its elected representatives are fully implemented, and the interviews carried out during the visit seem to confirm that staff can contribute to the Establishment's direction and to the decision-making processes.

9.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

9.4.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 9.4.

9.5 A system for assessment of teaching staff must be in operation and must include student participation. Results must be available to those undertaking external reviews and commented upon in reports.

9.5.1. Findings

The Establishment has put in operation a system for the assessment of teaching staff, and such a system of assessment/evaluation includes student participation. The system, called Quality Management System (QMS) was put in place a few years ago and it utilises different indicators; the evaluation is both quantitative (appreciation scale) and qualitative (open comments). The results of these evaluations are transferred to the heads of the teaching modules and teaching departments, to the head of the Education and student life, and to the Dean. Teaching evaluation done by the

students is a fully-integrated tool for continuous improvement of the school, and it is included in a comprehensive assessment methodology called “Teaching evaluation procedure”. Evaluation results can be made available to undertake external reviews.

9.5.2. Comments

Teaching evaluation done by the students is a fully integrated tool for continuous improvement of the school: the comprehensive assessment methodology applied by the Establishment is commendable, and it confirms the approach of the Establishment towards a student-focused education.

9.5.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

9.5.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 9.5.

Standard 10: Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education

10.1 The Establishment must demonstrate significant and broad research activities of staff that integrate with and strengthen the veterinary degree programme through research-based teaching.

10.1.1. Findings

Research at ENVT is divided into two main fields; an agro-veterinary field for which INRA is the main institutional partner and a bio-medical field, with INSERM as a major institutional partner. Six joint research units, a joint service unit and a joint technological unit are composed of one to several research teams and each team is made up of full-time researchers (mainly from INRA), lecturers and engineers and technical staff both from ENVT and INRA. Most lecturers are integrated into a research team. All research teams are led by the Head of Scientific Affairs, who is nominated by the Dean and is a member of the Executive Committee and Steering Committee at ENVT.

The research strategy divides the research into three bridging thematic themes:

- the chemical and biological stressors
- the interaction between stressor, microbiota and host
- detection and management of diseases, and appraisal their societal impact

ENVT has an ambition to merge research and veterinary training to utilize synergies between these two fields. A relatively recent “Scientific facilitation group for the promotion of research” has taken initiatives to enhance the integration and arranges an annual thematic Scientific Day with external speakers and presentation of activities of the ENVT’s research units. They also arrange a “Thesis market” where lecturers can propose research projects which may serve as a basis for students to write their experimental thesis.

10.1.2. Comments

The Establishment is commended for their excellent cooperation with several research centres that gives many of the lecturers the possibility to participate in different research projects. These activities also strengthen their teaching quality. The new Clinical Research Unit NeoCare is a good opportunity to strengthen clinical research and public-private partnerships.

10.1.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

10.1.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 10.1.

10.2 All students must be trained in scientific method and research techniques relevant to evidence-based veterinary medicine and must have opportunities to participate in research programmes.

10.2.1. Findings

The Extra-Practical Training period in year 2 can be taken as research activity, called the Stage project. This is a six-week period, but it may be extended to 12 weeks. The aim of this Stage project is that students should learn project management in facilities that are susceptible to employ a veterinarian (non-clinical). However, many students take this as their mandatory period abroad.

All students have to do a minimum of a 30 ECTS thesis, and 84% of these theses are based on experimental research or clinical surveys.

Students opting for a research career may spend the whole 5th year doing research (i.e. thesis of 60 ECTS), and this year may then be spent in any higher education institution. However, ENVT comments that it is difficult to recruit veterinary students for research, and only 3-7% of students follow the research track in the 5th year.

10.2.2. Comments

The research track is a good opportunity to booster a scientific career for those students interested, and it is positive that this may be done in collaboration with other universities.

Most of the 5th year students do their thesis based on experimental research, and the feedback from the lecturers was that they regard the student's work as a positive element that could strengthen their own research activities. The integration of the student thesis work and the research work of the lectures contributes to ensure that the students are well trained in scientific methods and research techniques.

10.2.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

10.2.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 10.2.

10.3 The Establishment must provide advanced postgraduate degree programmes, e.g. PhD, internships, residencies and continuing education programmes that complement and strengthen the veterinary degree programme and are relevant to the needs of the profession and society.

10.3.1. Findings

ENVT provides internships in clinical sciences, as well as School Clinical Diploma (one year) and further specialization at either French level (French Specialized Diploma) or European level (EBVS). There are three rotatory internships of the 4 French ENVs.

Due to national law, the ENVT does not issue the PhD diplomas themselves. This is done at the University of Toulouse level. Most of the PhD training and research is done related to two doctoral schools:

- Sciences for Ecology, Veterinary, Agronomy and Bioengineering
- Biology, Health, Biotechnologies

The compulsory PhD courses are provided by the doctoral schools, in which the ENVT lecturers actively participate as teachers. ENVT research teams hosted 28 PhDs on average per year (22 annual dissertations). Some doctoral schools have an upper limit on how many PhD-students can be

supervised per lecturer.

There are currently 18 EBVS certified training programmes running at ENVT, and another two will be added within short time.

ENVT is active in running continuing education courses, which are targeted at veterinary practitioners, industry executives and researchers. All courses are presented in the Continuing Education Catalogue. Last year a total of 538 participants attended a course, the average for the last three years is 486. Among these are courses qualifying for School Diploma (1-5 weeks) and the FELASA-accredited course in use and protection of laboratory animals.

10.3.2. Comments

The number of EBVS courses is good, but there are very few residents in each programme which makes each programme vulnerable.

ENVT should be appraised for the active participation in offering continuing education courses. Their excellent cooperation with stakeholders and alumni contributes to ensure that ENVT offers relevant courses that are needed for continuous education of veterinarians outside academia. The continuing education activity also provides some extra income for the Establishment.

10.3.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

10.3.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 10.3.

10.4 The Establishment must have a system of QA to evaluate how research activities provide opportunities for student training and staff promotion, and how research approaches, methods and results are integrated into the veterinary teaching programmes.

10.4.1. Findings

The research activities are supported by the Department of Scientific Affairs. A Scientific council, comprised of seven elected representatives from staff, one from PhD students and 11 external members appointed by the Ministry of Agriculture and Food, has taken several actions to monitor and promote research activities. Some financial support for research projects is specifically allocated to young lecturers or residents, and the Scientific council monitors the outcome of these projects.

The research activity of ENVT is exposed to several evaluations.

10.4.2. Comments

The fact that ENVT participates in external evaluations of their research helps the school to improve their quality and relevance of their research.

10.4.3. Suggestions for improvement

None.

10.4.4. Decision

The Establishment is compliant with Substandard 10.4.

11. ESEVT Indicators

Name of the Establishment: ENVT Toulouse, France					
Date of the form filling: January 7, 2020					
		Establishment values	Median value	Minimal value	Balance
I1	n° of FTE academic staff involved in veterinary training / n° of undergraduate students	0.184	0.16	0.13	0.058
I2	n° of FTE veterinarians involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	0.803	0.87	0.59	0.213
I3	n° of FTE support staff involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	1.444	0.94	0.57	0.877
I4	n° of hours of practical (non-clinical) training	1234.000	905.67	595.00	639.000
I5	n° of hours of clinical training	1642.000	932.92	670.00	972.000
I6	n° of hours of FSQ & VPH training	316.417	287.00	174.40	142.017
I7	n° of hours of extra-mural practical training in FSQ & VPH	37.333	68.00	28.80	8.533
I8	n° of companion animal patients seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	143.210	70.48	42.01	101.201
I9	n° of ruminant and pig patients seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	3.782	2.69	0.46	3.318
I10	n° of equine patients seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	3.697	5.05	1.30	2.399
I11	n° of rabbit, rodent, bird and exotic seen intra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	24.085	3.35	1.55	22.540
I12	n° of companion animal patients seen extra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	0.241	6.80	0.22	0.018
I13	n° of individual ruminants and pig patients seen extra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	11.769	15.95	6.29	5.474
I14	n° of equine patients seen extra-murally / n° of students graduating annually	0.000	2.11	0.60	-0.595
I15	n° of visits to ruminant and pig herds / n° of students graduating annually	0.779	1.33	0.55	0.232
I16	n° of visits of poultry and farmed rabbit units / n° of students graduating annually	0.756	0.12	0.04	0.712
I17	n° of companion animal necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	1.408	2.07	1.40	0.008
I18	n° of ruminant and pig necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	3.444	2.32	0.97	2.473
I19	n° of equine necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	0.064	0.30	0.09	-0.029
I20	n° of rabbit, rodent, bird and exotic pet necropsies / n° of students graduating annually	1.762	2.05	0.69	1.069
I21*	n° of FTE specialised veterinarians involved in veterinary training / n° of students graduating annually	0.341	0.20	0.06	0.278
I22*	n° of PhD graduating annually / n° of students graduating annually	0.215	0.15	0.09	0.127

The indicators at ENVT Toulouse are in the positive range, except I14 (the number of equine patients seen extra-murally), which is compensated by the high number of equine patients seen intra-murally (I10). The number of equine necropsies (I19) is lower than the minimal value, leading to partial compliance with Substandard 5.1. Nevertheless, measures were envisaged by the Establishment to increase these numbers by agreements with horse owners and their vets to provide the cadavers directly to ENVT and also to increase the visibility of the necropsy services provided.

12. ESEVT Rubrics (summary of the decision on the compliance of the Establishment for each ESEVT Substandard, i.e. (total or substantial) compliance (C), partial compliance (PC) (Minor Deficiency) or non-compliance (NC) (Major Deficiency))

Standard 1: Objectives, Organisation and QA Policy	C	PC	NC
1.1 The Establishment must have as its main objective the provision, in agreement with the EU Directives and ESG recommendations, of adequate, ethical, research-based, evidence-based veterinary training that enables the new graduate to perform as a veterinarian capable of entering all commonly recognised branches of the veterinary profession and to be aware of the importance of lifelong learning. The Establishment must develop and follow its mission statement which must embrace all the ESEVT standards.	X		
1.2 The Establishment must be part of a university or a higher education institution providing training recognised as being of an equivalent level and formally recognised as such in the respective country. The person responsible for the veterinary curriculum and the person(s) responsible for the professional, ethical, and academic affairs of the Veterinary Teaching Hospital (VTH) must hold a veterinary degree. The decision-making process of the Establishment must allow implementation of its strategic plan and of a cohesive study programme, in compliance with the ESEVT standards.	X		
1.3 The Establishment must have a strategic plan, which includes a SWOT analysis of its current activities, a list of objectives, and an operating plan with a timeframe and indicators for its implementation.	X		
1.4 The Establishment must have a policy and associated written procedures for the assurance of the quality and standards of its programmes and awards. It must also commit itself explicitly to the development of a culture which recognises the importance of quality, and quality assurance, within their Establishment. To achieve this, the Establishment must develop and implement a strategy for the continuous enhancement of quality. The development and implementation of the Establishment's strategy must include a role for students and other stakeholders, both internal and external, and the strategy must have a formal status and be publicly available.	X		
1.5 The Establishment must provide evidence that it interacts with its stakeholders and the wider society. Such public information must be clear, objective and readily accessible; the information must include up-to-date information about the study programme, views and employment destinations of past students as well as the profile of the current student population. The Establishment's website must mention the ESEVT Establishment's status and its last Self Evaluation Report and Visitation Report must be easily available for the public.	X		
1.6 The Establishment must monitor and periodically review its activities, both quantitative and qualitative, to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. The Establishment must make public how this analysis of information has been utilised in the further development of its activities and provide evidence as to the involvement of both students and staff in the provision, analysis and implementation of such data. Any action planned or taken as a result of this data analysis must be communicated to all those concerned.	X		
1.7 The Establishment must undergo external review through the ESEVT on a cyclical basis. Evidence must be provided of such external evaluation with the assurance that the progress made since the last ESEVT evaluation was linked to a continuous quality assurance process.	X		
Standard 2: Finances			
2.1 Finances must be demonstrably adequate to sustain the requirements for the Establishment to meet its mission and to achieve its objectives for education, research and services. The description must include both expenditures (separated into personnel costs, operating costs, maintenance costs and equipment) and revenues (separated into public funding, tuition fees, services, research grants and other sources).	X		
2.2 Clinical and field services must function as instructional resources. Instructional integrity of these resources must take priority over financial self-sufficiency of clinical services operations. The Establishment must have sufficient autonomy in order to use the resources to implement its strategic plan and to meet the ESEVT Standards.	X		
2.3 Resources allocation must be regularly reviewed to ensure that available resources meet the requirements.	X		
Standard 3: Curriculum			
3.1 The curriculum must be designed, resourced and managed to ensure all graduates have achieved the graduate attributes expected to be fully compliant with the EU Directive 2005/36/EC (as amended by directive 2013/55/EU) and its Annex V.4.1. The curriculum must include the subjects (input) and must allow the acquisition of the Day One Competences (output) listed in Annex 2. This concerns Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets), Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management), Food Safety and Quality, and Professional Knowledge.			
3.1.1. General findings	X		
3.1.2. Basic sciences	X		
3.1.3. Clinical Sciences in companion animals (including equine and exotic pets)	X		
3.1.4. Clinical Sciences in food-producing animals (including Animal Production and Herd Health Management)	X		
3.1.5. Food Safety and Quality	X		
3.1.6. Professional Knowledge	X		

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 17 JUNE 2020

<p>3.2 Each study programme provided by the Establishment must be competency-based and designed so that it meets the objectives set for it, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme must be clearly specified and communicated and must refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.</p> <p>The Establishment must provide proof of a QA system that promotes and monitors the presence of an academic environment highly conducive to learning including self-learning. Details of the type, provision and updating of appropriate learning opportunities for the students must be clearly described, as well as the involvement of students.</p> <p>The Establishment must also describe how it encourages and prepares students for self-learning and lifelong learning.</p>	X		
<p>3.3 Programme learning outcomes must:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ensure the effective alignment of all content, teaching, learning and assessment activities of the degree programme to form a cohesive framework • include a description of Day One Competences • form the basis for explicit statements of the objectives and learning outcomes of individual units of study • be communicated to staff and students • be regularly reviewed, managed and updated to ensure they remain relevant, adequate and are effectively achieved. 	X		
<p>3.4 The Establishment must have a formally constituted committee structure (which includes effective student representation), with clear and empowered reporting lines, to oversee and manage the curriculum and its delivery. The committee(s) must:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • determine the pedagogical basis, design, delivery methods and assessment methods of the curriculum • oversee QA of the curriculum, particularly gathering, evaluating, making change and responding to feedback from stakeholders, peer reviewers and external assessors, and data from examination/assessment outcomes • perform ongoing and periodic review of the curriculum at least every seven years by involving staff, students and stakeholders; these reviews must lead to continuous improvement. Any action taken or planned as a result of such a review must be communicated to all those concerned • identify and meet training needs for all types of staff, maintaining and enhancing their competence for the ongoing curriculum development. 	X		
<p>3.5 External Practical Training (EPT) is compulsory training activities organised outside the Establishment, the student being under the direct supervision of a non-academic person (e.g. a practitioner). EPT cannot replace the core intramural training nor the extramural training under the close supervision of academic staff (e.g. ambulatory clinics, herd health management, practical training in FSQ and VPH).</p> <p>Since the veterinary degree is a professional qualification with Day One Competences, EPT must complement and strengthen the academic education inter alia by enhancing student's professional knowledge.</p>	X		
<p>3.6 The EPT providers must have an agreement with the Establishment and the student (in order to state their respective rights and duties, including insurance matters), provide a standardised evaluation of the performance of the student during their EPT and be allowed to provide feedback to the Establishment on the EPT programme.</p> <p>There must be a member of the academic staff responsible for the overall supervision of the EPT, including liaison with EPT providers.</p>	X		
<p>3.7 Students must take responsibility for their own learning during EPT. This includes preparing properly before each placement, keeping a proper record of their experience during EPT by using a logbook provided by the Establishment and evaluating the EPT. Students must be allowed to complain officially and/or anonymously about issues occurring during EPT. The Establishment must have a system of QA to monitor the implementation, progress and then feedback within the EPT activities.</p>	X		
Standard 4: Facilities and equipment			
<p>4.1 All aspects of the physical facilities must provide an environment conducive to learning, including internet access. The veterinary Establishment must have a clear strategy and programme for maintaining and upgrading its buildings and equipment. Facilities must comply with all relevant legislation including health, safety, biosecurity, accessibility to people with reduced mobility, and EU animal welfare and care standards.</p>		X	
<p>4.2 Lecture theatres, teaching laboratories, tutorial rooms, clinical facilities and other teaching spaces must be adequate in number, size and equipped for the instructional purposes and must be well maintained. The facilities must be adapted for the number of students enrolled. Students must have ready access to adequate and sufficient study, self-learning, recreation, locker, sanitary and food service facilities.</p> <p>Offices, teaching preparation and research laboratories must be sufficient for the needs of the academic and support staff.</p>	X		
<p>4.3 The livestock facilities, animal housing, core clinical teaching facilities and equipment used by the Establishment for teaching purposes must:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • be sufficient in capacity and adapted for the number of students enrolled in order to allow safe hands-on training for all students • be of a high standard, well maintained and fit for the purpose • promote best husbandry, welfare and management practices • ensure relevant biosecurity and bio-containment • be designed to enhance learning. 			X
<p>4.4 Core clinical teaching facilities must be provided in a veterinary teaching hospital (VTH) with 24/7 emergency services at least for companion animals and equines. Within the VTH, the Establishment must unequivocally demonstrate that standard of education and clinical research are compliant with all ESEVT Standards, e.g. research-based and evidence-based clinical training supervised by academic staff trained to teach and to assess, availability for staff and students of facilities and patients for performing clinical</p>			

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 17 JUNE 2020

research and relevant QA procedures. For ruminants, on-call service must be available if emergency services do not exist for those species in a VTH. The Establishment must ensure state-of-the-art standards of teaching clinics which remain comparable with or exceeding the best available in the private sector. The VTH and any hospitals, practices and facilities (including EPT) which are involved with the curriculum must meet the relevant national Practice Standards.			X
4.5 The Establishment must ensure that students have access to a broad range of diagnostic and therapeutic facilities, including but not limited to: diagnostic imaging, anaesthesia, clinical pathology, intensive/critical care, surgeries and treatment facilities, ambulatory services, pharmacy and necropsy facilities.	X		
4.6 Appropriate isolation facilities must be provided to meet the need for the isolation and containment of animals with communicable diseases. Such isolation facilities must be properly constructed, ventilated, maintained and operated to provide for animal care and for prevention of spread of infectious agents. They must be adapted to all animal species commonly handled in the VTH.			X
4.7 The Establishment must have an ambulatory clinic for production animals or equivalent facilities so that students can practise field veterinary medicine and Herd Health Management under academic supervision.	X		
4.8 The transport of students, live animals, cadavers, materials from animal origin and other teaching materials must be done in agreement with national and EU standards, to ensure the safety of students and staff and to prevent the spread of infectious agents.	X		
4.9 Operational policies and procedures (including e.g. biosecurity, good laboratory practice and good clinical practice) must be taught and posted for students, staff and visitors and a Biosafety manual must be available. The Establishment must demonstrate a clear commitment for the delivery of biosafety and biosecurity, e.g. by a specific committee structure. The Establishment must have a system of QA to monitor and assure clinical, laboratory and farm services, including a regular monitoring of the feedback from students, staff and clients.		X	
Standard 5: Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin			
5.1 The number and variety of healthy and diseased animals, cadavers, and material of animal origin must be adequate for providing the practical and safe hands-on training (in the areas of Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences, Pathology, Animal Production, Food Safety and Quality) and adapted to the number of students enrolled. Evidence must be provided that these data are regularly recorded and that procedures are in place for correcting any deficiencies.		X	
5.2 In addition to the training provided in the Establishment, experience can include practical training at external sites, provided this training is organised under direct academic supervision and following the same standards as those applied in the Establishment.	X		
5.3 The VTH must provide nursing care skills and instruction in nursing procedures. Under all situations students must be active participants in the clinical workup of patients, including problem-oriented diagnostic approach together with diagnostic decision-making.	X		
5.4 Medical records must be comprehensive and maintained in an effective retrieval system (preferably an electronic patient record system) to efficiently support the teaching, research, and service programmes of the Establishment.	X		
Standard 6: Learning resources			
6.1 State-of-the-art learning resources must be adequate and available to support veterinary education, research, services and continuing education. When the study programme is provided in several tracks/languages, the learning resources must be available in all used languages. Timely access to learning resources, whether through print, electronic media or other means, must be available to students and staff and, when appropriate, to stakeholders. State-of-the-art procedures for bibliographical search and for access to databases and learning resources must be taught to undergraduate students.	X		
6.2 Staff and students must have full access on site to an academic library administered by a qualified librarian, an Information Technology (IT) unit managed by an IT expert, an e-learning platform, and all the relevant human and physical resources necessary for the development of instructional materials by the staff and their use by the students. The relevant electronic information, database and other intranet resources must be easily available for students and staff both in the Establishment's core facilities via wireless connection (Wi-Fi) and from outside the Establishment through a hosted secured connection, e.g. Virtual Private Network (VPN).	X		
6.3 The Establishment must provide students with unimpeded access to learning resources, internet and internal study resources, and equipment for the development of procedural skills (e.g. models). The use of these resources must be aligned with the pedagogical environment and learning outcomes within the programme and have mechanisms in place to evaluate the teaching value of changes in learning resources.	X		
Standard 7: Student admission, progression and welfare			
7.1 The Establishment must consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student "life cycle", e.g. student admission, progression and certification. In relation to enrolment, the Establishment must provide accurate and complete information regarding all aspects of the educational programme in all advertisements for prospective national and international students. Formal cooperations with other Establishments must also be clearly advertised.	X		
7.2 The number of students admitted must be consistent with the resources available at the Establishment for staff, buildings, equipment, healthy and diseased animals, and materials of animal origin.	N A		
7.3 The selection and progression criteria must be clearly defined, consistent, and defensible, be free of discrimination or bias, and take into account the fact that students are admitted with a view to their entry to the veterinary profession in due course. The Establishment must regularly review and reflect on the selection processes to ensure they are appropriate for students to complete the programme successfully. If the selection processes are decided by another authority, the latter must regularly receive feedback from the Establishment. Adequate training (including periodic refresher training) must be provided for those involved in the selection process to ensure applicants are evaluated fairly and consistently.	X		
7.4 There must be clear policies and procedures on how applicants with disabilities or illnesses are considered			

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 17 JUNE 2020

and, if appropriate, accommodated in the programme, taking into account the requirement that all students must be capable of meeting the ESEVT Day One Competences by the time they graduate.	X		
7.5 The basis for decisions on progression (including academic progression and professional fitness to practise) must be explicit and readily available to the students. The Establishment must provide evidence that it has mechanisms in place to identify and provide remediation and appropriate support (including termination) for students who are not performing adequately. The Establishment must have mechanisms in place to monitor attrition and progression and be able to respond and amend admission selection criteria (if permitted by national or university law) and student support if required.	X		
7.6 Mechanisms for the exclusion of students from the programme for any reason must be explicit. The Establishment's policies for managing appeals against decisions, including admissions, academic and progression decisions and exclusion, must be transparent and publicly available.	X		
7.7 Provisions must be made by the Establishment to support the physical, emotional and welfare needs of students. This includes, but is not limited to, learning support and counselling services, career advice, and fair and transparent mechanisms for dealing with student illness, impairment and disability during the programme. This shall include provision of reasonable adjustments for disabled students, consistent with all relevant equality and/or human rights legislation. There must be effective mechanisms for resolution of student grievances (e.g. interpersonal conflict or harassment).	X		
7.8 Mechanisms must be in place by which students can convey their needs and wants to the Establishment. The Establishment must provide students with a mechanism, anonymously if they wish, to offer suggestions, comments and complaints regarding compliance of the Establishment with national and international legislation and the ESEVT standards.	X		
Standard 8: Student assessment			
8.1 The Establishment must ensure that there is a clearly identified structure within the Establishment showing lines of responsibility for the assessment strategy to ensure coherence of the overall assessment regime and to allow the demonstration of progressive development across the programme towards entry-level competence.	X		
8.2 The assessment tasks and grading criteria for each unit of study in the programme must be published, applied consistently, clearly identified and available to students in a timely manner well in advance of the assessment. Requirements to pass must be explicit. The Establishment must properly document the results of assessment and provide the students with timely feedback on their assessments. Mechanisms for students to appeal against assessment outcomes must be explicit.	X		
8.3 The Establishment must have a process in place to review assessment outcomes, to change assessment strategies and to ensure the accuracy of the procedures when required. Programme learning outcomes covering the full range of professional knowledge, skills, competences and attributes must form the basis for assessment design and underpin decisions on progression.	X		
8.4 Assessment strategies must allow the Establishment to certify student achievement of learning objectives at the level of the programme and individual units of study. The Establishment must ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.	X		
8.5 Methods of formative and summative assessment must be valid and reliable and comprise a variety of approaches. Direct assessment of clinical skills and Day One Competences (some of which may be on simulated patients), must form a significant component of the overall process of assessment. It must also include the quality control of the student logbooks in order to ensure that all clinical procedures, practical and hands-on training planned in the study programme have been fully completed by each individual student.		X	
Standard 9: Academic and support staff			
9.1 The Establishment must ensure that all staff are appropriately qualified and prepared for their roles, in agreement with national and EU regulations and must apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of staff. A formal training (including good teaching and evaluation practices, learning and e-learning resources, biosecurity and QA procedures) must be in place for all staff involved with teaching. Most academic staff (calculated as FTE) involved in veterinary training must be veterinarians. It is expected that more than 2/3 of the instruction that the students receive, as determined by student teaching hours, is delivered by qualified veterinarians.	X		
9.2 The total number, qualifications and skills of all staff involved with the programme, including teaching staff, 'adjunct' staff, technical, administrative and support staff, must be sufficient and appropriate to deliver the educational programme and fulfil the Establishment's mission. A procedure must be in place to assess if they display competence and effective teaching skills in all relevant aspects of the curriculum that they teach, regardless of whether they are full or part time, residents, interns or other postgraduate students, adjuncts or off-campus contracted teachers.	X		
9.3 Staff must be given opportunities to develop and extend their teaching and assessment knowledge and must be encouraged to improve their skills. Opportunities for didactic and pedagogic training and specialisation must be available. The Establishment must clearly define systems of reward for teaching excellence in operation. Academic positions must offer the security and benefits necessary to maintain stability, continuity, and competence of the academic staff. Academic staff must have a balanced workload of teaching, research and service depending on their role. They must have reasonable opportunities and resources for participation in scholarly activities.	X		
9.4 The Establishment must provide evidence that it utilises a well-defined, comprehensive and publicised programme for the professional growth and development of academic and support staff, including formal appraisal and informal mentoring procedures. Staff must have the opportunity to contribute to the Establishment's direction and decision-making processes.	X		

FINAL REPORT AS ISSUED BY ECOVE ON 17 JUNE 2020

Promotion criteria for academic and support staff must be clear and explicit. Promotions for teaching staff must recognise excellence in, and (if permitted by the national or university law) place equal emphasis on all aspects of teaching (including clinical teaching), research, service and other scholarly activities.			
9.5 A system for assessment of teaching staff must be in operation and must include student participation. Results must be available to those undertaking external reviews and commented upon in reports.	X		
Standard 10: Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education			
10.1 The Establishment must demonstrate significant and broad research activities of staff that integrate with and strengthen the veterinary degree programme through research-based teaching.	X		
10.2 All students must be trained in scientific method and research techniques relevant to evidence-based veterinary medicine and must have opportunities to participate in research programmes.	X		
10.3 The Establishment must provide advanced postgraduate degree programmes, e.g. PhD, internships, residencies and continuing education programmes that complement and strengthen the veterinary degree programme and are relevant to the needs of the profession and society.	X		
10.4 The Establishment must have a system of QA to evaluate how research activities provide opportunities for student training and staff promotion, and how research approaches, methods and results are integrated into the veterinary teaching programmes.	X		
C: (total or substantial) compliance; PC: partial compliance (Minor Deficiency); NC: non-compliance (Major Deficiency)			

Executive Summary

The Ecole Nationale Vétérinaire de Toulouse, one of the four French veterinary establishments, was founded in 1828, being relocated in 1960 to a large rural campus site in the Midi-Pyrénées Region (now Occitanie Region) and it opened for student in 1964. All French veterinary establishments are under the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Agriculture and share a common curriculum, but organise the development of the training in their own ways. Teaching, research and management at ENVT were evaluated in 2015 by the High Council for the Evaluation of Research and Higher Education and the establishment will undergo a similar evaluation in 2020.

The ENVT was visited initially by EAEVE in 1997 and subsequently in 2010, when EAEVE Team highlighted a single category 1 deficiency, “Lack of appropriate equine surgery facilities and equipment”. The ENVT was revisited in 2014 and granted full approval, after building a new equine clinic which became operational in 2013.

The SER was well written, complete and provided on time to the Visitation Team along with the Appendices. The questions asked by experts before the Visitation as well as all the documents asked for during the visitation were willingly provided.

The Visitation was very well prepared, well organised and carried out in a cordial and professional atmosphere. The Liaison Officer was very efficient, diligent and always helpful. The programme of the Visitation was designed ahead the Visitation, some minor changes being made on the site and easily implemented upon request of the Visitation Team. The Visitors had full access to all the information, facilities and individuals they asked for.

Areas worthy of praise (i.e. Commendations), e.g.:

- Student-focused education
- Mentoring of younger by more advanced students
- Compulsory stage abroad
- Transparency of all processes and openness of the teachers
- The commitment and enthusiasm of staff and students
- Positive interaction between students and staff
- Willingness to further develop teaching and research
- Excellent cooperation with the Research Centres, external stakeholders and alumni
- Effective implementation of a QA system

Areas of concern (i.e. Minor Deficiencies):

1. Partial compliance with Substandard 4.1 because of sub-optimal compliance of some of the physical facilities with relevant legislation concerning biosecurity and EU animal welfare and care standards;
2. Partial compliance with Sub-standard 4.9 because of sub-optimal posting of biosecurity signs in some areas where students are trained;
3. Partial compliance with Substandard 5.1 because there was a sub-optimal number and variety of cadavers for anatomy and necropsy;
4. Partial compliance with Substandard 8.5 was found because of sub-optimal use of a logbook system for recording of clinical skills.

Items of non-compliance with the ESEVT Standards (i.e. Major Deficiencies):

1. Non-compliance with Substandard 4.3. because the ruminant core clinical facility is not of a high standard and does not promote the best husbandry, management, welfare and biosecurity practices;
2. Non-compliance with Substandard 4.4 because of the absence of a 24/7 service for equine species at the VTH, an inadequate on-call service for ruminants and the absence of state-of-the-art standards in the ruminant and equine teaching clinics;
3. Non-compliance with Substandard 4.6 because of inadequacy of isolation facilities for equine and ruminant species.

Glossary

Abbreviations

EAEVE: European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education

ECOVE: European Committee of Veterinary Education

EPT: External Practical Training

ESEVT: European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training

FSQ: Food Safety and Quality

QA: Quality Assurance

SER: Self Evaluation Report

SOP: Standard Operating Procedure

SWOT: Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, Threats

VPH: Veterinary Public Health

VTH: Veterinary Teaching Hospital

Standardised terminology

Accreditation: status of an Establishment that is considered by ECOVE as compliant with the ESEVT Standards normally for a 7-year period starting at the date of the last (full) Visitation;

Establishment: the official and legal unit that organise the veterinary degree as a whole, either a university, faculty, school, department, institute;

Ambulatory clinic: clinical training done extra-murally and fully supervised by academic trained teachers;

Establishment's Head: the person who officially chairs the above described Establishment, i.e. Rector, Dean, Director, Head of Department, President, Principal, ...;

External Practical Training (EPT): clinical and practical training done extra-murally and fully supervised by non-academic staff (e.g. practitioners);

Major Deficiency: a deficiency that significantly affects the quality of education and the Establishment's compliance with the ESEVT Standards;

Minor Deficiency: a deficiency that does not significantly affect the quality of education or the Establishment's compliance with the ESEVT Standards;

Re-visitation: a partial visitation organised in agreement with the ESEVT SOP in order to evaluate if the Major Deficiencies identified during a previous Visitation have been corrected

Visitation: a full visitation organised on-site in agreement with the ESEVT SOP in order to evaluate if the veterinary degree provided by the visited Establishment is compliant with all ESEVT Standards; any chronological reference to 'the Visitation' means the first day of the full on-site visitation;

Visitation Report: a document prepared by the Visitation Team, corrected for factual errors and finally issued by ECOVE; it contains, for each ESEVT Standard, findings, comments, suggestions and identified deficiencies.

Decision of ECOVE

The committee concluded that the following Major Deficiencies had been identified:

1. Non-compliance with Substandard 4.3 because the ruminant core clinical facility is not of a high standard and does not promote the best husbandry, management, welfare and biosecurity practices;
2. Non-compliance with Substandard 4.4 because of the absence of a 24/7 service for equine species at the VTH, an inadequate on-call service for ruminants and the absence of state-of-the-art standards in the ruminant and equine teaching clinics;
3. Non-compliance with Substandard 4.6 because of inadequacy of isolation facilities for equine and ruminant species.

The École Nationale Vétérinaire de Toulouse (ENVT) is therefore classified as holding the status of: **NON-ACCREDITATION**.